Citizen Jane: Exploring the Relationship Between Gender and Cellular Phones in Societies of Control

by
Heather Fiona Maguire

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree Master of Arts

MA Program in Social Justice and Equity Studies BROCK UNIVERSITY St. Catharines, Ontario

September 2007

© Heather Fiona Maguire, 2007
For Christopher V.B. Taylor ~
Your guidance, teaching and love live on.
You, unfortunately, did not.
Acknowledgements

There are many people, without whom, I would not have been able to complete this degree. First and foremost, I would like to thank my supervisory committee, Dr. Catherine Jean Nash, Dr. Dale A. Bradley and Dr. David Butz. Catherine, you have insisted upon clarity and logic, and I believe that I am a better writer because of you. Dale, you have never hesitated to share knowledge, provide support and strategic advice; you are the kind of teacher I hope one day to be. David, as program director, theory teacher and committee member, your input has been invaluable.

I am indebted to the Social Justice and Equity Studies faculty and staff. In particular, I would like to thank Dr. Jane Helleiner for getting me through this summer and all of its tribulations. A big thanks to Ethna, Linda and Jill for making the whole process so much nicer. I would also like to acknowledge the faculty in Brock University’s Communications, Popular Culture & Film Department. It is only through the strong teaching and mentorship provided by this department that the possibility of graduate school became a reality.

I met an amazing group of people in my cohort, and I am very grateful to the ‘Aunts’ for rocking, feeding, and babysitting baby Mae during her early months as an extra SJES student. Cheryl, you have been there through Winston, Saskatoon and beyond. Your friendship means a great deal to me, and I look forward to making the next leg of the journey together.

Most of all, I am grateful to my family. Dean, thank you for always picking up the pieces and making sure I didn’t give up. You have never wavered in believing in me, and I would not be here without you. Connor, you termed this thesis my “lifemare” and that’s very funny indeed. Mae, you insisted on arriving in the middle of it all, and have been good enough to be wooed to sleep by listening to me read aloud the gentle words of Foucault. You three make it all worthwhile.

Joe Strummer once sang, “You’ll need a nit comb to get rid of me.” And so ends my time at Brock. Lurking in the halls, on and off, since 1988, I believe it’s finally time to move on.

This thesis has been generously supported through a CGS Master’s Scholarship provided by the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada (SSHRC).
Abstract

In this thesis, I argue that the mutually productive relationship between women (as gendered subjects) and cellular phone technology is one of control. Women use cellular phones to organize, manage and otherwise control the multiplicity of tasks required of them on a daily basis. At the same time, through using cell phones, women participate in regimes of control including surveillance and persistent connection. I explore this relationship at the level of everyday practice, and conclude by speculating about this relationship at a wider level of social control and organization.

This argument emerges from the critical approach suggested by Slack and Wise (2005), who argue that technology and culture are inseparable. They provide articulations and assemblages as tools of analysis. I situate this analysis more broadly within Foucault’s (1991) work on governmentality, in its modern form of societies of control (Deleuze, 1995b).
# Table of Contents

**Acknowledgements** ........................................................................................................ ii

**Abstract** ............................................................................................................................ iii

**Table of Contents** ............................................................................................................. iv

**Chapter I: Introduction** ..................................................................................................... 1
  Main Argument and Critical Approach ................................................................................ 5

**Chapter II: Critical Approach** ........................................................................................ 16
  Introduction ......................................................................................................................... 16
  Governmentality & Control Societies .................................................................................. 18
  Cultural Studies & Foucault ............................................................................................... 21
  Cultural Studies of Technology ......................................................................................... 26
  Gender and Communications Technology ...................................................................... 35
  Summary ............................................................................................................................. 40

**Chapter III: The Importance of Advertising** ................................................................ 43
  Introduction ........................................................................................................................ 43
  Advertising as Cultural Artifact ......................................................................................... 44
  Advertising as Process ....................................................................................................... 46
  Data Sources and Collection ............................................................................................ 49
  Limitations of this Research ............................................................................................. 53
  Summary ............................................................................................................................. 54

**Chapter IV: Control and Everyday Practices: Exploring Articulations of Gender and Cell Phones** ......................................................................................................................... 56
  Introduction ........................................................................................................................ 56
  Mothering & Cellular Phones ............................................................................................ 59
Appendix XIII: Nokia Gives Elvis the Edge. 127

Appendix XIV: Summary of Advertisements 128
Chapter I: Introduction


-Motorola advertisement (1996)

My interest in cellular phones is not one of disconnect, if you will pardon the pun. I am not a detached observer. The woman in the Motorola advertisement sounds very similar to me. Along with at least half of the Canadian population, I own a cellular phone. I bought my first cellular phone in 1997, shortly after the birth of my first child and return to the workforce. I felt good about this purchase. Now, if I was at work or traveling to or from, I could be reached. I had voicemail, so that if by chance I was unavailable, I was still in contact. I chose a sleek black model (as ‘sleek’ as they came in 1997) by Nokia, and began a three-year contractual relationship with my service provider. *Why did I feel better by being so available all the time?* This is the kind of question about the relationship between women and cellular phones that I started to think about as I began work on my thesis project. It seems to me that I felt better when I bought my cellular phone because this device meant that I could be a better mother, a better employee, a *better citizen* because I was more accessible, available and connected.

There is something about the cellular phone and the notion of civic responsibility that seems to emerge in public discourse; somehow, these little devices have become linked in popular imaginings to being ‘good citizens’ if you will. Two examples quickly come to

---

1 My position as a researcher is one of a middle-class, white, heterosexual, married woman, living in a small city in Ontario, Canada. I am a full-time graduate student, part-time teaching assistant and mother of two children.
mind. On July 7, 2005, the BBC received fifty images after the first bomb exploded in the underground rail system – all taken on cellular phones (Douglas, 2005). All of these images were taken by ordinary citizens on their way to work, caught up in the bombings, documenting the detritus on their mobile phones. These ‘citizen-journalists’ snapped pictures and e-mailed them to the major British news agency within moments of the bombing (Douglas, 2005). More recently, another British news outlet, *The Guardian*, reported on the suspicious circumstances surrounding the arrest of a German academic on suspicion of terrorist-related activities. Andrej Holm, a sociologist based in Berlin, was arrested and detained for aiding and abetting a militant group. The charges seem to stem from Holm’s research interest in gentrification, his access to information and strangely enough, the fact that Holm did not take his mobile phone with him to a meeting he attended, thereby fostering “conspiratorial circumstances” (Connolly, 2007). In each of these instances, mobile phones emerge as key markers of being ‘good’ citizens.

Londoners were good citizens by quickly sending images from the depths of the tube stations, active and contributing to the media’s coverage of the attacks. Holm was seen as nefarious, sneaky and conducting himself inappropriately because he did not have his mobile with him.

The ways that the conduct of citizenship and cellular phones seem to be discursively linked together is fascinating, and warrants exploration. My own research interests centre on considering this link through the lens of gender. This is an important consideration, because gender is one of the ways that individuals ‘conduct their conduct’ (to borrow from Foucault) in such a way as to conform to and abide by a particular set of guidelines.
about being 'good' citizens. I had a feeling that the use of cellular phones was fast becoming one of the ways that gendered subjects could become 'good' citizens. So, in many ways, this project stems from my long-standing interest in the mutually productive relationship between women\(^2\) (as gendered subjects) and technology. It develops in both a narrow and wide sense. At the level of everyday practice, it is productive to develop an analysis of how women and cellular phones are co-constitutive. That is, I am interested in the ways that cellular phones both enable and constrain women in their everyday lives. In a more broad sense, I am interested in speculating about the mutually productive relationship between women and cellular phones through a wider discussion about citizenship, social regulation and civic engagement. This desire to discuss the relationship between women and cellular phones at the level of social organization and control arises out of my own personal views about the importance of politicizing discussions about the everyday socio-cultural practices of women by engaging with broader networks and systems of power relations. More importantly, the critical approach and theoretical analytics that I employ to analyze the relationship between women and cellular phones suggest that it is necessary to situate such analyses within broader constellations of meaning.

Before I attend to the specifics of the argument, approach and analysis to be found herein, it is worthwhile to spend a moment to flesh out what it is I mean by the relationship

\(^2\) I use the term "women" to articulate a particular gendered subject position. In this project, the "women" to whom I refer tend to be married, middle class, white and heterosexual. Moreover, in a general sense I focus on mothering as a gendered practice within this particular intersection of cultural markers. While early on I remind the reader that I am talking about women as gendered subjects by bracketing a comment, for all intents and purposes, whenever the term "women" appears, it is with an acknowledgement that this is a problematic term which has been narrowly defined as a particular subject position herein.
between women and technology being mutually productive, because this is the cornerstone upon which this thesis is built. Some see technology to be instrumental; technologies are value-neutral tools at our disposal. Others see technology as being an autonomous force, existing and operating beyond our control.¹ Both of these views have been appropriately criticized for not adequately describing the relationship between technology and culture (Feenberg, 2002; Slack and Wise, 2005). Another way to think about technology is to conceptualize it as being part of culture, neither wholly determined by, nor wholly determining socio-cultural relations (Slack and Wise, 2005). From this perspective, there is a certain reciprocity in how both technology and culture emerge; they mutually produce each other. It is not possible to separate culture from technology or vice versa. Gender, as a key social organizer and part of culture, is a component of this mutually productive relationship. Women are produced as gendered subjects in part through their relationships with technologies. At the same time, technologies acquire their social and cultural meaning through how they are used by social subjects, including women. The cellular phone, therefore, is culturally produced partly through the ways that it seeps into the lives of women, and at the same time, women are produced as gendered subjects partly through the ways that they use cellular phones in their everyday lives.

¹ See Feenberg (1991 and 2002) for a thorough and useful exploration of these two 'received' views of technology. Feenberg argues that technology is actually a 'site of struggle' between conflicting and competing outcomes.
Main Argument and Critical Approach

In this thesis, I argue that the mutually productive relationship between women and cellular phones is one of control. Women, as gendered subjects, use cellular phones to help control and manage various aspects of their lives. At the same time, these women participate in arrangements whereby they are constrained by control – they are under constant surveillance and are always accessible through instantaneous communication. This argument unfolds by considering this relationship between women and cellular phones as a social practice that constitutes everyday life. At this level of everyday practice, I consider the ways in which women are positioned to use cellular phones to help them function with their everyday tasks: mothering, working, volunteering, shopping and so on. The cell phone is represented in such a way as to help women perform myriad daily responsibilities that are required of them. These are responsibilities that are represented as the tasks of ‘properly’ gendered women and help reinforce what we expect women to do as part of their daily lives. At the same time, through cell phone use, women participate in regimes of control that constrain them: being always available, under surveillance and constantly (persistently) connected to networks. The relationship between women and cellular phones in this sense focuses on women, as gendered subjects, and how cellular phones can operate seamlessly in ordinary daily routines.

I then speculate about how this relationship, at the level of everyday practice, links up to the level of social organization and control, by drawing upon Foucault’s (1991) work on governmentality as well as cultural studies researchers who consider the importance of

---

4 In general, I am discussing a relationship that emerges within a Canadian context.
new technologies in the emergence of modern forms of regulation, social organization and control (Hay, 2003; King, 2003). Using this framework, I suggest that cellular phone use can be considered a mechanism of governance that contributes to the shaping of identities (in particular, "Supermom") and leads to the constitution of new subjects (in particular, "Citizen Jane") in specifically gendered ways.5

Critical Approach

Differentiating between and separating everyday practices from the socio-cultural environments in which they operate is problematic, because the socio-cultural is nothing if not comprised of the everyday social practices of people, and these everyday social practices are shaped by the participation in, and lived experiences of people within broader networks of social, economic, cultural and political environments. However, for analytical purposes it is useful to bracket out for a moment these everyday practices from their social contexts. Borrowing a phrase from Fraser (1989) I participate in a process of "bracketing" whereby I momentarily separate (or 'bracket') these practices from their contexts, and suspend the problems associated in so doing, in order to tease out and explore the ways in which the relationship between women and cellular phones operates at the level of everyday practice. Moreover, the set of theoretical analytics from which my argument emerges, namely Foucault’s (1991) governmentality and Slack and Wise’s (2005) cultural studies of technology, suggests that it is important to explore everyday

5 This argument about cellular phone use as a mechanism of governance is based upon a similar argument made by King (2003). King analyses the “Run for the Cure” as a mechanism of governance, and considers how volunteerism and physical activity (amongst other activities) are part of being “good” Americans. While her research does not directly pertain to my research, the structure of her argument has been helpful in guiding the formulation of my speculations.
social practices within a broad social context. Chapter 2 explores these frameworks in more detail, but I introduce them here.

Slack and Wise (2005, 2002) have developed a cultural studies approach to technology, whereby they argue that technology and culture are inseparable; they mutually produce each other. Slack and Wise (2005, 2002) suggest that researchers consider both articulations and assemblages in order to comprehensively describe technological culture. Articulations are the contingent connections between any number of disparate elements, where the focus is on the articulation (relationship) rather than the element. Slack and Wise (2005) recognize that their use of the word “elements” can be misleading. They do not mean “elements” in the sense of single, discrete items or material things. Rather, they suggest that elements can be any of the following: “words, concepts, institutions, practices and affects, as well as material things” (2005: 127). Gender and cellular phone technology, used in this way, can be considered elements. This project analyzes the articulation between gender and cellular phone technology at the level of everyday practice.

Assemblages according to Slack and Wise (2005) are the ways that different technologies stake out, draw boundaries around, converge and draw together various articulations at a particular moment. The articulation (relationship) between gender and cellular phones takes a particular form based upon its socio-economic, political and historical period. I understand assemblages to work at the level of social control and organization, in that we are no longer just exploring how cellular phones and women mutually produce one
another in everyday practice. Now we are also considering the broader social context of these relationships. While the main argument developed in this thesis focuses on the articulation between gender and cellular phone technology, I tentatively begin the work of sketching out assemblages within Foucault’s (1991) work on governmentality generally, and more specifically within “societies of control” – Deleuze’s (1995a and b) conceptualization of Foucault’s (1991) governmentality in the present day.

Governmentality is a term that Foucault (1991) introduced during a series of lectures in the late 1970s. Foucault used the term governmentality in both a broad and narrow sense (Gordon, 1991). It is the ‘conduct of conduct’ – how individuals govern themselves and their relationships, but it is also how one governs and is governed in one’s dealings with institutions and in relation to political organization and population control (Foucault, 1991; Gordon, 1991; Bratich, McCarthy and Packer, 2003). Thus governmentality works by regulating and controlling populations through the everyday practices of individuals.

Gathering & Analyzing Evidence

In order to demonstrate my argument, I analyze a series of advertisements for cellular phone companies that appeared in two Canadian magazines, Canadian Living and Chatelaine, between 1995 and 1999. I have chosen to use advertising to demonstrate my argument for two main reasons. As a site of social discourse, advertising captures cultural meaning and concerns, providing a snapshot of a particular historical moment (Jhally, 1999). Therefore, advertising can be seen as a place where the articulation between gender and cellular phones is rendered visible. Furthermore, advertising works insofar as it is a process whereby the reader identifies with the subject positions being
presented and 'buys into' the identity being sold. Althusser calls this process hailing and interpellating (Williamson, 1978). This process is important for more speculative discussion about the assemblage of gender and cellular phones because advertising participates in the production of identities and subject positions. As such, when considering how cellular phone use by women becomes a mechanism of governance that produces new identities and cultivates new subjects, advertising plays an important role. Advertising is explored in greater detail in Chapter 3.

Cellular phones have become ubiquitous, permeating the fabric of everyday life. As argued by de Souza e Silva (2006), “Technologically speaking, ubiquity can be defined as the ability to communicate anytime, anywhere via computer devices spread out in the environment” (2006, 25). However, as with every technological device, this state of ubiquity is neither instantaneous nor without struggle. Just ten years ago, cellular phones were on the periphery, mainly imagined as a tool for business. By 2000, the majority of Canadian households had at least one cellular phone (StatsCan, 2000). The time period that I have focused on, 1995 to 1999, was chosen because this was the five-year period during which cellular phones were ‘seeping’ into everyday practices (i.e., they were no longer simply a tool for the businessperson). Because the cultural meaning and uses of technology are neither predetermined nor inert, the time period during which they become part of everyday practice is important. Technologies have valence, in that there

---

6 The term “ubiquitous” used in this context draws upon the work of Mark Weiser (1998), who understands this stage of technological integration to be one where technologies have faded into the background of our lives, the stage of "calm computing." Adriana de Souza e Silva (2006) provides a detailed exploration of Weiser’s work and how it relates to cell phone technology.

7 Certainly these dates are not absolute because this “seeping” into everyday practice did not begin precisely on January 1, 1995. However, as is outlined more specifically in Chapter 3, this is the general time period during which there was the most growth in the domestic market.
are a limited number of possible uses and ways in which they can fit into our lives (Martin, 1991). I focus on this time period because it was the time during which the “scene of struggle” about how cellular phones would operate in the lives of middle-class, Canadian women was taking place.

The magazines, Canadian Living and Chatelaine, were chosen because they target the particular group of women that I am interested in writing about, namely middle-class, Canadian women who (for the most part) tend to be mothers – a market segment (and subject position) that played a crucial role in the domestication of cellular phone technology. Canadian Living and Chatelaine are two of the most well-circulated, established Canadian magazines that are geared towards middle-class women. Both magazines carried advertisements by three major cellular phone companies, Nokia, Motorola and Cantel during the time period outlined.

**Situating the Relationship Between Gender & Technology**

“Woman” is a problematic term. Feminists have long contended that essentialist and ‘natural’ understandings of a whole and coherent woman erase and ignore the very real, lived realities of different ethnic, classed and sexualized bodies (amongst other cultural markers). In my research, I understand “woman” to be a particular gendered subject position and in this context I focus primarily on practices of mothering. Gender is the discursive construction that differentiates between biological sexes based upon a particular set of socially constructed expectations about appropriate behaviour and presentation. Gender determines the ‘proper’ way in which male and female bodies

---

8 Martin (1991) argues that the possibilities are limited because, for example, a toaster cannot be a cd player.
should act, so as to produce separate categories: man and woman. Therefore, how a ‘woman’ understands herself and is intelligible to others is based upon the historically specific discursive environment in which she happens to find herself.

Rakow and Navarro (1993) argue that gender is an intrinsic part of technology. Technologies have a long history of being closely linked with gender, in production, use, design and effect. Rakow and Navarro state that, “technologies both represent and enact gender ideology, or our belief structure about gender” (1993: 145). Hence, gender is contingent, shifting, historically and culturally specific, and technology, as part of cultural practice, works to both represent and enact dominant understandings of gender. Because technology and culture are inseparable, constitutive elements of each other, and gender is part of culture, then gender and technology are mutually productive.

In Chapter 4, I explore this mutually productive relationship in greater detail, using Slack and Wise’s (2005) framework of articulations to focus not so much on gender and cellular phones as two separate elements, but rather to focus on the relationship, or connection between the two. I have organized the analysis of the advertisements by using five overlapping themes: mothering, professionalism, mobility, safety/surveillance and isolation. These themes were not predetermined. Rather, they emerged through my analysis, because I needed to find a way to organize my interrogation of the articulation between gender and cellular phones. That said, however, these themes are also supported by the theoretical framework I outline in Chapter 2, where I consider recent research on the relationship between gender and cellular phones. This relationship between the
theoretical framework and themes is reinforced in some detail in the analysis of the advertisements. It is important to note that these themes do not provide an exhaustive account of all the possible ways that gender and cellular phones intersect in these advertisements. Instead, they are five themes that help me to analyze and express the relationship between gender and cellular phones in some detail, specifically relating to my theoretical framework.

*In Control: The Emergence of Citizen Jane*

I have titled this thesis *Citizen Jane*, because what emerges from my theoretical framework and analysis is the notion of control - control of and over oneself and one's life – as a mechanism of governmentality. In Chapter 5 (the concluding chapter), I tentatively sketch out how everyday practices become apparatuses of governmentality, producing new identities and constituting new subjects. Control emerges as a key theme in my critical approach, based on the work of Beniger (1986) and Deleuze (1995). Beniger (1986) provides the historical background to what he terms the "control revolution" whereby he argues that since the industrial revolution there has been a massive increase in the amount of information and data produced, leading to a crisis of control. Governments have been forced to find new and creative ways to control and manage this information and data, leading to the production of new communication technologies of control such as bureaucracy, the typewriter, and the computer (to name a few). Deleuze (1995 a and b) builds upon Foucault's (1991) work on governmentality, suggesting that what Foucault was really talking about in his governmentality lectures was control. Governing is no longer simply a matter of sovereignty or discipline; instead, control is the present form of governmentality. In this sense, where governing involves
managing vast amounts of information in order to plan, organize and regulate populations, it is reliant upon control. As such, control functions neither through brute force nor disciplinary institutions⁹, but through everyday practices associated with instant communication and constant connection to networks.

Within societies of control, a new “citizen-subject” emerges (Hay, 2003). Hay (2003) argues that the current form of governmentality relies upon the “citizen-subject” in order to properly manage the disposition of people and things across vast spaces. The “citizen-subject” is responsible, self-disciplining and self-sufficient, bound to the processes to which they are subjected in everyday life (Hay, 2003: 166-167). Using this argument, women as “citizen-subjects” are not simply responsible citizens for their own personal gain (although this is certainly part of the processes of governmentality), but are morally bound to fostering and reinforcing the stability of the state. Women as “citizen-subjects” reinforce the gender roles and expectations that constitute them. Citizen Jane is this new citizen-subject. With her cell phone in hand, she can accomplish so much. In the advertisements analyzed herein, Citizen Jane is portrayed as having superhuman abilities. She can transcend the boundaries of time and place. She can work from home and manage the home from work. She is persistently connected to networks and always available. She is the mobile citizen, a key figure in societies of control.

I note here the difference between identities, subjects and subject positions. People become subjects by ‘conducting one’s conduct’ through such disciplinary practices as

---

⁹ Deleuze (1995a and b) is careful to note that control does not supplant brute force or discipline. They still operate. This is more of a general shift that Deleuze is seeing.
self-regulation. We are produced as subjects through discourse, and within specific relations of power. People, as subjects, arbitrate various identities that allow us to be legible to others. Identities are partial, shifting, transforming and never complete (Hall, 1996). Through discourse, various subject positions are produced, and people locate themselves in relation to these different subject positions. "Identities are thus points of temporary attachment to the subject positions which discursive practices construct for us" (1996: 6). Identity is thus derived from our identification with the various and multiple subject positions made available to us. In the advertisements studied herein, there are several subject positions made available, including but not limited to 'mother,' 'professional,' 'communicator,' 'volunteer,' 'chauffeur,' and 'wife.' The identity, "Supermom" emerges at the point where these multiple subject positions converge.

In this introductory chapter, I have outlined the main argument of this thesis, and provided an introduction to the theoretical context in which this argument is based. I argue that the articulation between women, as gendered subjects, and cellular phone technology is one of control. Women use cellular phones to help them control and manage their particularly gendered responsibilities of everyday life. At the same time, women participate in regimes of control that constrain them, including surveillance, constant availability and connection. This relationship is explored through identifying five themes that emerge in a specific set of advertisements: mothering, professionalism, mobility, safety/surveillance and isolation. I have also introduced the speculative work that I do to conclude this thesis, where the articulation between gender and cellular phones is placed within the social context of control societies and governmentality.
Although this argument is preliminary, it is suggestive of some of the interesting work that needs to be done, exploring how a particular kind of gendered identity and subject emerges through assemblages within a society of control.
Chapter II: Critical Approach

We're definitely moving toward "control" societies that are no longer exactly disciplinary. Foucault's often taken as the theorist of disciplinary societies and of their principal technology, confinement. But he was actually one of the first to say that we're moving away from disciplinary societies, we've already left them behind. We're moving toward control societies that no longer operate by confining people but through continuous control and instant communication. 

- Gilles Deleuze (1995b: 174)

Introduction

In the previous chapter, I introduced the set of theoretical analytics that I work with to develop my analysis of the relationship between gender and cellular phone technology. This chapter is devoted to a more thorough and nuanced discussion of this framework. The organization of this thesis is built upon an analysis of the relationship between women and cellular phones in everyday practices. Chapter 4 explicitly focuses on control in everyday lives of women using cellular phones, whereas Chapter 5 speculates about this control relationship as a mechanism of governmentality. One of the challenges of research involves the difficult task of separating everyday practices from their social contexts for the purposes of analysis while at the same time denying the existence of such a differentiation. I acknowledge at the outset that everyday practices and the social context in which they operate are not mutually exclusive categories; everyday practices comprise the social, and it is the social that constitutes the everyday practices of individuals. Fraser (1989) has argued that it is possible for the purposes of analysis to "bracket" off and separate categories of analysis and momentarily suspend the reasons why it is problematic to do so. Moreover, both Foucault (1991) and Slack and Wise (2005) point to the importance of developing analyses that deal with the "politics of
everyday life”. Thus, it is in keeping with my analytical framework to develop an
analysis of the relationship between gender and cellular phones not only as everyday
practices, but also as constitutive of broader systems and networks of social control and
organization.

I work in both a narrow and wide sense, and tease out the ways in which my analysis
emerges through analyzing everyday practices, while simultaneously recognizing the
importance of socio-cultural and historical context. This chapter begins widely,
exploring Foucault’s (1991) notion of governmentality as it is applied in this research
project. I then begin the process of narrowing by taking up the emergence of “control
societies” which Deleuze (1995) suggests is the present form of governmentality.
Control is the key theme of this project, and so I attend to the emergence of control
particularly in relation to technology. I then narrow further, by considering the
intersection between cultural studies and Foucault in order to explore and describe the
relationship between the social subject, everyday cultural practices and the stabilization
of modern forms of governance and the maintenance of power relations. This section
explores some of the links between citizen-subjects and social control, particularly related
to governmentality. From there, I consider specifically the substantive application of
Slack and Wise’s (2005) approach to understanding technology within this broad cultural
studies approach. I then provide a brief overview of current academic literature on
gender and communications technology and demonstrate how this project fills gaps in
current literature.
The argument developed in this thesis is that the relationship between gender and cellular phone technology is one of control. Women, as gendered subjects, use cellular phones to control various aspects of their lives: time, children, work, family, domestic space and so forth. At the same time, through the use of cellular phones, women enter into a relationship with "regimes" of control: surveillance, accessibility, being always connected through time and space. This argument is grounded in the critical approach to studying technological culture introduced by Slack and Wise (2005), and takes up the theme of control through a Deleuzian engagement with Foucault.

Governmentality & Control Societies

Foucault introduced the concept of governmentality in the late 1970s to describe the process of "governing one's self and others" (Gordon, 1991). It refers to the "art of government" which addresses questions about how to conduct oneself, others and how to be governed (Foucault, 1991: 87). As Gordon (1991) argues, Foucault refers to governing in a broad sense (population control) as well as in a narrow sense (the (self)control of individuals). Governmentality is the "conduct of conduct" that involves various practices, techniques and control apparatuses. Central to this concept is the idea that the governor-governed relationship is not one of brute force, nor is it absolute control through disciplinary institutions. Instead, governmentality explores the rationality behind governing populations at a distance, where "the strength of the state relies upon the proper disposition of humans and things" (Bratich et al., 2003: 4). As Foucault points out, the responsibility of governance does not lie solely with the state; it is dependent upon the coordinating actions of its subjects (1991: 102). Governmentality thus concerns itself with both individual coordinating activities, as well as those of the state.
Governmentality is about the ‘conduct of conduct’ of individuals, to stabilize and benefit the activities of the state.

Deleuze (1995 a and b) suggests that the modern form of governmentality is control. Extending Foucault’s work on governmentality to the current post World War II time period, Deleuze (1995) suggests that disciplinary societies are receding, with their institutional boundaries and discrete sites of regulation. Control societies, according to Deleuze, emerge when there is a breakdown in the strict boundaries of disciplinary institutions. Control societies are ones in which institutions are collapsing, where clear delineations between separate places no longer exist (Deleuze, 1995b). In control societies, nothing is ever finished; work is never done, nor is education. Continuous connection and instantaneous communication are key apparatuses of the control society. According to Bratich, “We are increasingly seeing these disciplinary forces seep out of their bounded institutions and discourses and radiate throughout the social body” (2006: 69). Control societies rely not upon sovereign power, nor disciplinary power, although these forces continue to be part of control societies, but rather upon mechanisms that “become imminent to their networked circuit of deployment” (Bratich, 2006: 69). This is a crucial transformation; in this modern form of governmentality, networks, databanks and the capillary forms of power operating in everyday cultural forms and practices are now key sites of regulation, coordination and control.

Deleuze (1995) hints at the importance of communication technologies in control societies when he suggests that modern forms of confinement operate not through places
such as prisons and hospitals, but rather through instant communications and continuous connection. Beniger (1986) has explored control in relation to the rise of information and communication technologies in post-industrial North America and his contribution to linking the broad notion of control to communication technologies is important. Beniger (1986) traces the “control revolution” from its long history based on a crisis of control occurring as a result of mass production and industrialization. In his terms, control involves both influence and purpose, whereby control is derived through moderating, coordinating and regulating action with a specific goal in mind (Beniger, 1986: 7).

Post World War II, control is increasingly linked to information and communication technologies because these technologies have been created to process large amounts of information while maintaining communications over vast distances. Governments now rely upon computerized processing networks and integrated databanks in order to rationalize, control and manage populations (Beniger, 1986; Webster, 1995). Deleuze’s prescience, therefore, was to pinpoint this move from disciplinary society to control society, as it points to a different modality of power, where information processing, persistent communication and the seeping of institutional boundaries leads to new forms of social control. The emergence of places such as the “home office,” for example, exemplify this transformation, where there are no longer boundaries between these sites of confinement (the domestic sphere and the workplace). Technologies including cellular

---

10 Barry (1996) provides an excellent discussion of these developments, noting the increased need for statistical and precise measurements of social and economic information by the state. Barry uses the telegraph as an example of the ways in which communication technology and modern government are inextricably linked. As governments negotiated enormous information spaces of the new telegraphic community, they needed the structure developed in which they could operate efficiently.
phones, blackberries, computers and video-conferencing hardware and software all help to facilitate this kind of transformation.

**Cultural Studies & Foucault**

In order to understand the relationship between gender and cellular phone technology as a relationship of control within the broader discourse of control societies, it is helpful to make some links between control societies and everyday practices. Cultural studies theorists have begun to trace the importance of Foucauldian interventions into analyses of culture that address issues such as governmentality, specifically locating the implication of Foucault on research and inquiry into modern forms of governing as it concerns everyday life (Bratich et al., 2003). As noted above, the shift to control societies requires new forms of governing, not through domination and brute force, nor entirely through discipline, and so it is interesting to think about the subject’s relationship with the state — a relation of power — in control societies. With the breaking down of institutions comes an increased focus on the subject, because it is the subject who bears the burden of control. Disciplinary power works insofar as it regulates right down to the level of the body, whereby the practices and conduct of individual subjects is required for the functioning of the state. It is at this intersection, with a focus on everyday practice and the relationship between the subject and the state that this particular branch of cultural studies becomes useful.

---

11 For example, Bratich (2003) considers the role of the television in stabilizing neoliberal ideology within the domestic sphere, and how this translates to a stable, functioning state.
12 Deleuze (1995b) gives the examples of the breaking down of prisons, where such things as electronic monitoring devices work to break down the division between the prison and the home, and the downloading of hospital services (and the rise of home care) to the home as examples of this shift to control, and the implications for the individual.
Cultural studies theorists argue that Foucault’s influence in understanding the place of the subject within control societies helps to demonstrate the shift to a greater reliance on the self, in terms of governance and control (Hay, 2003; Rose, 1999). Hay discusses the relationship between the subject and the state:

[S]ocial subjects are not and should not be subject to direct forms of state control, it relies upon mechanisms for governing ‘through society,’ through programs that shape, guide, channel – and upon responsible self-disciplining social subjects [emphasis in original] (2003: 166).

From this perspective, the role of the subject in the stabilization and maintenance of social control and governance figures prominently, whereby it is required that the subject participates in and supports mechanisms of control in order for a society to function. Therefore, the ‘ordinary’ and ‘everyday’ practices of citizen-subjects play a crucial role in the (re)production of power and the maintenance of social control.

This shift towards a greater reliance on the citizen-subject is important, because it further illuminates the crucial roles that subjects have in sustaining and maintaining control societies. It is not a matter of domination, but instead relies upon freedoms of individuals (Hay, 2003). Foucault argues that there is an entire range of practices that “constitute, define, organize and instrumentalize the strategies that individuals, in their freedoms, can use in dealing with each other” (1977: 300, as quoted in Hay, 2003: 166). Freedom from Foucault’s perspective is a process, where freedom is defined not as freedom from subjection, but as one's ability to conduct one's conduct. Hay states that,

Governing at a distance and acting freely both require an implicit contract or arrangement – procedures, techniques, and rules of conduct across different spheres of life. In this sense, freedom (living and governing at a distance) pertains to a new political and governmental rationality, to rules of conduct that are not purely juridical but that decidedly make freedom political and ethical, an ongoing process of governing oneself, properly

The subject, therefore, becomes responsible for their “good citizenry” by applying and abiding by these arrangements. Thus “conducting one’s conduct” in such a way as to adhere to the implicit arrangement required for social control is of paramount importance to the success of a state. Put another way, a subject’s agency is framed, but not wholly determined, by state apparatuses. Moreover, this can be seen as a recursive relationship because the formations of different modes of governing emerge through social relations at level of the citizen and their everyday social practices. In other words, as much as the state constitutes the practices of its subjects, so do the activities and practices of citizen-subjects constitute the form that the state takes.

This relationship between the individual and the state is one of power. Power, Foucault argues, is relational. It is not seated in any one place, but operates in and through relationships. Foucault states, “Individuals are the vehicles of power, not its points of application” (Foucault, 1997, as quoted in Hay, 2003: 167). This highlights the importance of the subject, as a “vehicle of power” in the maintenance and stabilization of the state. Because modern states govern at a distance, they must rely on the proper conduct of subjects. Hay suggests, “To say that power is exercised or practiced, therefore implies that power involves discipline and regularity as well as the activity and freedom of individuals” (2003: 168). What can be taken from Hay’s argument is that Foucauldian power operates not only as a “power over” where there are rules that are followed, but also as a “power to” where the subject has the freedom to exercise power through their own conduct. The power of the state thus lies in its ability to derive power from
individual practices. Power, from this perspective, is “capillary”, operating at the level of everyday practice of individuals (Fraser, 1989).

Although there is little work that brings gender into dialogue with governmentality in the context of cultural studies research, it can nevertheless be a productive discussion. King (2003) argues that mechanisms of governmentality play vital roles in the shaping of identity and the cultivation of political citizen-subjects. While not explicitly dealing with gender, King (2003) examines the ‘Race for the Cure’ as a site that cultivates a specific form of ideal citizenship, through practices of philanthropy and volunteerism. King demonstrates how conducting one’s conduct is primarily achieved through notions of being a “good citizen.” Gender as a social organizing principle is a key element of this process. Gender, as understood in my research, is a social construction whereby subjects are categorized, sorted and otherwise organized based upon their sex. Subjects are constituted in and through discourse in particularly gendered ways. Thus the processes of governmentality, including self-regulation, governing oneself and acting responsibly are done in accordance with particular discursive understandings and expectations about gender. The ways in which gender is shaped and cultivated is dependent upon the mechanisms of governmentality in a particular historical and cultural time.

It is important to reiterate the importance of exploring governmentality through everyday social practices, as well as situating these social practices within broader socio-economic,

---

13 As well, feminists have been particularly interested in taking up Foucault in relation to individual practices, and there is a rich body of literature available that explores these linkages. (See Bartky (2003) as an example.)
14 While Foucault focuses on the cultivation of the subject within relations of power, King adds to the discussion by taking up how identities are produced at the same time.
cultural and political context. I began this section by considering broad societal concerns, introducing governmentality and control societies. This section has explored Foucault's (1991) concept of governmentality as the art of governing both the subject and populations through the 'conduct of conduct.' Because Foucault uses governmentality to describe the art of governing in many different time periods, I have drawn upon Deleuze (1995), because Deleuze argues that control societies are a particular form of governmentality that can be used to describe the current state of affairs. Deleuze is not alone in taking up "control" as a central organizing principle of modern social order. Beniger (1986) traces the historical emergence of control and points to the importance of information and communication technologies in the processes and practices that emerge in control societies. I then begin the process of narrowing the discussion, focusing on the importance of the subject in considerations of governmentality. I have drawn upon work done at the intersection of cultural studies and governmentality in order to accentuate the importance of the citizen-subject within these broad webs of control. Establishing the importance of the citizen-subject in the (re)production, maintenance and stabilization of state power and control, leads cultural studies researchers to examine how this works out in everyday practices, because cultural studies is particularly concerned with the 'everydayness' and 'ordinariness' of culture, and how power operates within these activities. Hay's (2003) research, for example, examines the role of television within the domestic sphere as a site where neoliberalism is supported and reaffirmed. My own research fits within this critical approach by considering the relationship between gender and cellular phone technology at the level of everyday practices of individuals, while also
considering the production of the citizen-subject within societies of control. How can technology be theorized from this perspective?

**Cultural Studies of Technology**

Cultural Studies of Technology argues that technology is not separate from culture, but an integral part of culture. In their introductory text, Slack and Wise (2005) use the phrase “technological culture” to express this understanding. This shifts research away from analyses of mechanistic and deterministic understandings of technology, to a richer, nuanced approach that seeks to contextualize technological development within cultural, historical and social realms. From a cultural studies perspective, technologies are comprised of the connections between disparate elements that form some kind of unity or meaning at a particular moment in time (Slack and Wise, 2005; du Gay, Hall, Janes, Mackay and Negus, 1997).

For example, Slack and Wise (2005) consider surveillance technologies in post-911 New York. They argue that analyzing surveillance technology from the “received view,” where technologies are objects free from the culture in which they arise, is inadequate because it does not account for the historical circumstances out of which these surveillance technologies have emerged, or how these technologies operate in everyday life. Analyses developed from a cultural studies perspective ask questions about such issues as terrorism, levels of racism and classism, global networks of information sharing, privacy laws and policies, and citizenship as they intersect with particular devices such as video cameras. All of these elements (and many others) happen to come together in a culturally specific place and time to mean something in the ‘ordinary’ lives of New
Yorkers. This perspective, shifting research focus from technology's effect on culture to researching a more circuitous set of interrelated processes, provides new understandings and insights into the cultural place of technologies. Slack and Wise (2005) suggest that researchers consider developing an analysis from a cultural studies perspective. This perspective involves conceptualizing technological culture, articulations and assemblages. I outline these critical analytical tools here.

"Technological Culture"

Slack and Wise (2005) argue that the received view of technology and culture is that they are somehow separate entities that influence each other in different ways. They state that developing an analysis from this view means trying to understand and explain the relationship between technology and culture as if these entities can somehow be cleaved off and analyzed. This approach leads the researcher towards understanding technology and culture on a continuum between technological and cultural determinism.

Technological determinists believe that technological change is the primary force affecting cultural change. Technologies become "revolutionary" forces (Slack and Wise, 2005: 45). The discourse of technological determinism has seeped into studies of cellular phones. A recent book by Levinson (2004) is a good illustration of this position. Entitled, "Cellphone: The story of the world's most mobile medium and how it has transformed everything!" this book proceeds to trace the historical roots of mobile communications, yet heralds the mobile phone as a revolutionary device. Cultural determinists, on the other hand, believe that culture shapes technology. From this perspective, technologies arise out of a society's need or desire, and are reflective of that
culture. Slack and Wise (2005) use the example of the gun, and illustrate the cultural determinist position in the National Rifle Association slogan, “guns don’t kill people, people kill people.” In this case, technology is entirely absolved from any responsibility, and it is culture that is being held to account.

Both of these positions (and the continuum between them) have proven to be unsatisfactory ways of understanding technology (Slack and Wise, 2005; Feenberg, 2002). Technological determinism ignores the role that people play in developing and using different devices. As Arnold Pacey (1991) argues, technologies are not value-neutral tools at our disposal. They arise out of a complex set of technological, organizational and cultural interactions, and thus reflect the values of these spheres. Cultural determinism sees technology simply as a device, one that does not have any effects unto itself. Returning briefly to the example of the gun, Slack and Wise (2005) point out that although the gun does not kill people without a human pulling the trigger, it certainly makes the process easier and entirely different than another method of killing.

To step beyond this dichotomy, Slack and Wise (2005) propose researching from a different perspective termed “technological culture.” Drawing from Williams’ theory of culture as both a “whole way of life” and “ordinary,” they argue:

But if, as we suggest, culture is “a whole way of life” – understood as a process that includes artifacts such as technologies – then technology and culture are not two separate identities whose relationship is the central problem of technological culture. From the perspective of culture as a whole way of life, technologies are integral to culture, not separate from it. In that case, it makes less sense to talk about culture and technology. Instead, what is needed is a model and a vocabulary that brings technology
fully into the concept of culture to begin with. We use the term *technological culture* to mark that difference (Slack and Wise, 2005: 5).

This is an important shift away from conceptualizing technology and culture, not as discrete categories but as components of a “whole way of life.” The focus of research questions shift as well, moving from questioning the relationship between technology and culture to considering the way in which technological culture is comprised of many components, and how these various components connect and intersect.

There are three assumptions on which this approach is based (Slack & Wise, 2005: 127). The first assumption is that technologies are not autonomous; they are connected to the context within which they are developed and used. This assumption shifts research focus towards thinking about the connections between the device and its context. In my research, this assumption helps to think about the cellular phone as being a historically situated product of a plethora of choices both in how it is produced and used. Cellular phones are part of Canadian social life. As such, I suggest that women use them in order to gain control over many aspects of their lives, so that people can be better (gendered) subjects. Cellular phones are a product of the control society, while at the same time helping to (re)produce it.

The second assumption is that culture is made up of connections. That is, culture is how connections and relationships come together. We can think of culture as the networks and connections between institutions, social groups, individuals and so forth. Slack and Wise (2005) posit that cultural components such as education or the economy are interrelated and bound up in each other (amongst other elements). They term culture a
“complex web of connections” (Slack & Wise, 2005: 110), and technology is part of that web. Theorizing cellular phones, then, asks that we think about the cellular phone’s place in this “complex web.” We can think about the wireless industry in Canada, for instance, changing business practices based upon mobile interfaces, the culture of “cool” and how cellular phones are bound up in this culture both as a product and as a producer, changing policies in the education system, and cellular phone journalism – just to name a few. Thinking about the “web of connections” helps guide my research by considering the relationship between gender and technology as a connection; gender and technology mutually produce one another within and through culture.

Third, technologies arise within these connections as part of them and as effective within them. Very closely related to the other two, this third assumption calls for a non-mechanistic discussion that moves beyond cause and effect (as mutually exclusive terms). Put simply, technologies are part of culture, operative within it and reflective of it. Technology is a process of shifting and changing connections and relationships. Theorizing the cellular phone requires thinking about how it has emerged out of particular relationships and forces, and how it affects these connections. For my research, this final assumption maps out the ways in which technologies are both a product of culture and produce culture. It supports my assertion that women, as gendered subjects, and cellular phones mutually produce one another.

From this perspective, research moves away from asking how technologies affect culture and how culture affects technology because they are not conceptualized as separate
entities with easily defined boundaries and edges. One cannot determine where technology ends and culture begins. To help provide a framework for theorizing technology from this perspective, Slack and Wise (2005) rely upon two cultural studies terms, articulations and assemblages.

Articulations

Articulations are the connected elements, relationships and contingent links that come together to form what we understand technology to be. These connections are contingent because they are not certain, necessary or essential. As Slack and Wise argue, “Articulation can be understood as the contingent connection of different elements that, when connected in a particular way, form a specific unity” (2005: 127). Thus articulations are not concrete, stable or permanent. Their identity shifts through time and space. The elements that comprise these articulations can include material objects, discourses, practices and institutions (Slack and Wise, 2005: 127). The focus is not on the element, but on the connection or articulation between elements, the relationships and movements that intersect, conjoin and otherwise collide at a particular moment in time.

Applying the concept of articulations to cellular phones in Canada means that this technology can be understood as the contingent relationship between at least the following elements: the material, physical arrangement of cellular phone technology including handsets, transmission towers, batteries, and digital communication technology; Canadian communications policy bodies and lobby groups including the Canadian Radio-television and Telecommunications Commission and the Canadian Wireless Telecommunications Association; a desire to communicate from unfixed
locations; a propensity towards gadget fetishism and fashion accessories; discourses of safety and security; popular culture's fascination with instant communication, text messaging service, ringtones and multi-functional camera/mp3/television handsets; cultural expectations about gender, ethnicity and class; increased pressure to be available beyond working hours and "on call" by employers; parents' surveillance of their children; a vast and influential youth culture movement; manners, rules and regulations about digital devices in public spaces (for example in restaurants, washrooms, change rooms, classrooms); automobile use, commuting, accident rates and the pressure from insurance companies to ban cellular phone use in cars and so on. ¹⁵ This project considers the articulation between gender and cellular phone technology, particularly considering the relationship between women and cellular phones. While the relationship between women and cellular phones has taken on a particular form within a specific socio-cultural setting (which I argue herein is one of control), this relationship is contingent and unstable. Cellular phones did not have to take on the particular meaning in the everyday lives of women that I explore herein. Rather, it happened to emerge this way, at this specific moment in time. This articulation would be entirely different if the focus was on men, for example. Thus the cultural meaning that is attached to cellular phones is dependent upon the elements that come together.

For the purposes of my research project, where I consider the mutually productive relationship of control between gender and cellular phones, I consider articulations at the

¹⁵ This is only an example of some of the many articulations to consider when doing a cultural analysis of cellular phone technology. It is not meant to be the entire gamut, just a notation of some useful relationships to consider, included as a way of exemplifying and clarifying what is meant by articulation. My thesis does not in any way attempt to incorporate all of these elements, nor the ensuing articulations.
level of the everyday social practices. In this sense, control can be seen to work in the ways that women use cellular phones to help manage their everyday tasks and responsibilities, while at the same time being constrained by the demands put forth through cellular phone use, such as being always available.

**Assemblages**

Slack and Wise are explicit in their suggestion that it is not enough to simply look at the articulation between gender and cellular phones in everyday social practices, because this does not adequately take into account the broader socio-economic, cultural and political environment in which technologies operate. Slack and Wise argue that, “Technology as assemblage adds to this understanding by drawing attention to the ways that these practices, representations, experiences, and affects articulate to take a particular dynamic form” (2005: 129). Drawing upon Deleuze and Guattari’s concept of “constellations” Slack and Wise (2005) posit that assemblages are the ways in which different technologies stake out, draw boundaries around, converge and draw together various articulations at a particular moment.

Considering the assemblages relating to cellular phones requires mapping out the ways in which the articulations listed above come together, draw boundaries, territorialize and otherwise attain tenacity at a particular moment. As Slack and Wise argue,

> In making the leap to technological assemblage, it is important to remember that a technological assemblage is not a simple accumulation of a bunch of articulations on top of one another, but a particular concrete

---

16 This is not to say that Slack and Wise suggest that articulations work at this level. This is one way of interpreting their approach in order to work through the two scales that I am focusing on herein.
A constellation of articulations that assemble a territory that exhibits tenacity and effectivity (2005: 130).

Researching the cellular phone involves rendering visible the broad web in which these devices operate, sketching out how the flows of articulations come together in a particular time and place. Mapping out the assemblages of cellular phone technologies includes considering the history of its design, its place within Western late-capitalist society, consumer expectations and appropriations, its association with other new digital media including the internet, other wireless communication devices and the rise of instant communications, just to name a few.17 I devote my attention mainly to exploring the articulation between gender18 and cellular phone technology – considering the multiple and complex ways that this relationship emerges in advertising. In my concluding chapter, I begin the work of assemblage, and I speculate about the possibilities for further research in this area. One possibility for analyzing the assemblage of cellular phones within broader constellations of meaning is through governmentality. Chapter 5 concludes with some speculation about the assemblage of cellular phones and women within a broader network of control and governmentality, and looks more closely at the production of identities and the cultivation of new subjects within this context.

Implications for This Project

Using Slack and Wise’s (2005) text as a critical approach asks the researcher to consider both articulations and assemblages in order to analyze technological culture. I am interested in the articulations (relationships) between gender and cellular phone

---

17 These are not what my specific project is about, but are examples of some of the possible ways that assemblages can be explored.

18 As noted in the introduction, I do not deal with gender in its entirety, but more specifically gender as understood through the practices of mothering (and even more specifically, Canadian, middle-class, heterosexual mothers).
technology. I then speculate about this particular relationship in a broader sense by drawing upon governmentality to understand the assemblage of this articulation at a particular historical moment. In the time period upon which I focus, the form that governmentality takes is that of control. Control societies simultaneously free and enslave (Deleuze, 1995b). There is freedom; freedom for individuals to be self-reliant and self-sufficient (within the limitations of the discourses that constitute them). At the same time, there is enslavement; work is never done, communication is instantaneous and constant, institutional breakdowns trickle down to where individuals now bear the brunt of personal care and responsibility. Considering the articulations of gender and cellular phone technology within this control society is important, because technologies are part of the mechanisms of control.

**Gender and Communications Technology**

This final section looks specifically at gender and communications technology, and works to provide support for my assertions about the mutually productive relationship that exists between gender and mobile phones. It shows how my research contributes to the growing work from a cultural studies frame, while demonstrating some gaps in current literature that I hope to begin to close. Several scholars seek to trace the cultural realm of cell phone technologies, and an emerging body of work looks at the cellular phone from an international perspective in ways that help to deepen our understandings of these technologies globally (Leonardi, Leonardi and Hudson, 2006; Kavoori and Chadha, 2006; Kavoori and Arceneaux, 2006; Ling 2004). In general, academic literature on mobile information and communication technologies (MICTs) falls into two
main groups. Macro level research examines the socio-political and economic impact of mobile technologies, as well as changing communication practices (Castells, 2007; Levinson, 2004; Rheingold, 2002). This research tends to erase or ignore the subtle social differences between users, including issues of gender. Micro level research takes up specific events and usage patterns but tends to be both ahistorical and/or apolitical (Ling, 2004; Myerson, 2001). I have explored some of the reasons why it is important to work in both a wide and narrow sense, addressing both everyday social practices and the social contexts in which they operate in relation to women and cellular phones. Exploring the articulations (relationships) between gender and cellular phone technology, and recognizing that these articulations are situated within broader assemblages of social organization and control works to fill the gap that has emerged between the broad and narrow research that has emerged.

The argument presented herein is that women, as gendered subjects, use cellular phone technology to help control various aspects of their lives. At the same time, these women submit to arrangements whereby they are constrained by control – they are under constant surveillance, are always accessible and in constant communications (the key tactics of a control society). This argument focuses on how women use cellular phones in everyday life to manage their daily tasks, while simultaneously being bound by MICT-supported networks of control.

---

19 This literature review speaks to the general patterns arising out of Western bodies of knowledge. For the most part, the literature reviewed herein focuses on North American research on MICTs, although it does take into consideration some of the work arising out of other parts of the world. Because the usage patterns and adoption rates are significantly different in North America (i.e., lacking behind other parts of the world), research done in other parts of the world that deals with the themes proposed herein does not apply neatly to a North American context.
Cultural studies research on gender and cellular phone technology is surprisingly sparse, particularly in North America. In other parts of the world, researchers have begun to explore some of the implications of gender and mobiles that address the gap between micro and macro level research. In situations of poverty and migrant work, the cellular phone is seen as an agent of change, or as supportive of transnational mobility by enabling women to maintain familial ties and mothering roles from long distances (Uy-Tiocco, 2007; Lee, 2007). Furthermore, Lemish and Cohen (2005) studied the gendered uses of mobile phone technology in Israel, and their study revealed that mobiles were used to reinforce traditional gender roles and patterns, as well as supporting spatial divisions between private and public spaces. These studies argue that in other parts of the world, gender and cellular phone technology are mutually productive; cell phones seem to support traditional gender roles and practices, and people tend to use the technology in particularly gendered ways. This research is important because it foregrounds the contributions of research that seeks to place individual (and everyday) practices within broader socio-political and economic discussions. My research provides a similarly relevant discussion.

Researching the realities of women living in poverty in developing countries, and those attempting to maintain mothering roles through transnational mobility is critical for researchers concerned with social justice, because technologies do contribute to the possibility of more equitable life situations. However, it is problematic to overlook the lived experiences of middle-class women (as a particular gendered identity) within a North American context. To assume that differences do not exist between how men and women use and understand cellular phones in their everyday lives is to assume that there are no differences between men's and women's lived experiences, both at work and at
home. However, research that looks more generally at telephone systems (non-mobile) and women, prove that these differences do matter.

Martin (1991) provides a discussion of the creative and productive ways in which female operators eventually effected policy change at Bell Canada. Through a political-economy lens, Martin demonstrates that women produced and participated in the development of a very different social role for the telephone, which had been imagined as primarily a business tool. This work is useful particularly for demonstrating the valence of technologies in that there are a limited number of possible uses and outcomes for technological devices. The ways in which, and reasons why, a technology is produced may be entirely different from its social outcome. Its place and social meaning is a complex production of a variety of cultural practices. What is most interesting about Martin’s research is that she provides a historical analysis of the telephone system in Canada, and demonstrates the point at which there was a shift in how telephone service unfolded. For researchers, Martin demonstrates the importance of considering the historical emergence of technology as it articulates with gender, because the point of emergence into everyday practice is critical for the future of that technology. It is not predetermined, this relationship between gender and technology. It is productive and contingent.

Rakow (1988) (re)writes the history of the telephone in the United States, and examines the ways in which women were positioned in advertisements in the early twentieth century. Rakow concludes that,

The story of the history of the telephone cannot be told without accounting for the gender relations within which a telephone system developed. The telephone, in turn, was used to construct and maintain gender differences and hierarchies. The story of the telephone teaches us the lesson that communication technologies in a gendered society are not gender-neutral (1988: 224).
Rakow's research focuses on the effects of these gendered devices on the social practices of those that use them, and is an important piece of the history of communications technology. Furthermore, both Rakow (1988) and Martin (1991) argue that considering technology in relation to gender is a complex task; the relationship between gender and technology is much more complex than perhaps we imagine it to be. These ideas are surfacing in the work being done that focuses on women and cellular phone technology.

In their 1993 study, Rakow and Navarro study the early impact of cellular phone technology on women in the United States – a point during which marketing to women was “on the horizon” (Rakow and Navarro, 1993: 149). At this point, they argue that the ‘supermom’ approach to marketing was not yet visible, but that there were nevertheless differences between how women and men were depicted in advertisements. Rakow and Navarro’s research notes that women practice “remote mothering” whereby women “exist in their domestic and work worlds simultaneously” (1993: 153). Furthermore, through interviews, they consider the role that men have in shaping technology for women. In particular, they demonstrate that women’s husbands are concerned for their safety, and thus encourage the use of the cellular phone as a safety device, thereby reproducing a gendered understanding of men as “protector” (Rakow and Navarro, 1993: 154).

Shade (2007) has done more recent research on cellular phone technology, paying close attention to ‘gender scripting’. This process, she argues, considers how technologies embody gender in particular ways, through design and marketing strategies. By examining marketing material and advertisements for cellular phones, Shade argues that, “The gendered scripts here, through explicit user-representations, reinforce women’s role as consumer and as object, with uses for sociability, shopping and entertainment” (2007: 186). Shade’s research, focusing on the materiality of the design of the phone itself as a
process of feminizing, is an important and useful contribution to emerging work on cellular phones. Furthermore, Shade's research is particularly useful because, similarly to Rakow (1988), she uses marketing materials and advertising as an evidentiary trail to tease out the relationship between gender and mobile phone technology. The next chapter, which details the research that I have carried out, discusses advertising in much the same way.

**Summary**

In this chapter, I have paid particular attention to outlining the set of theoretical analytics that I have used to frame my argument about the relationship between gender and cellular phone technology, working in both a wide and narrow sense. For the purposes of analysis, I have “bracketed” everyday practices from their social contexts in order to help focus this discussion. I began widely, introducing broad discussion about Foucault’s (1991) governmentality as the proper disposition of people and things. Governmentality involves the management and control of populations, whereby large populations are managed across vast spaces by relying upon subjects conducting their conduct in such a way that is conducive to being governed. Deleuze (1995) takes up governmentality and places it within a modern context, arguing that we have shifted from societies of discipline to those of control. In control societies, there are no longer distinctions between public and private; state institutions are breaking down and responsibilities are downloaded onto the individual. Control societies function not through domination, but through continuous control and instant communication. Beniger (1986) was used to provide support for this theme of control, while simultaneously tying in the importance of information and communication technologies. I then considered the intersection of cultural studies and Foucault, whereby cultural studies theorists argue that governing is...
done through granting freedoms and responsibilities to citizen-subjects. It is these citizen-subjects who bear the responsibility of peace, order and governing by being productive and responsible. Subjects, therefore, are vehicles of power, working to uphold, stabilize and maintain state control through their own activities and behaviours. Cultural studies, imbued with Foucault, becomes a useful critical approach from which to work, because of its focus on the importance of the 'ordinary' and 'everyday' practices in the (re)production of power and the maintenance of social control.

In order to theorize how technologies intersect with and inform these mechanisms of governmentality I have drawn upon the work of Slack and Wise (2005), who argue that technologies that are utilized in a particular culture are inextricably a part of that culture; technology cannot be cleaved off and objectively analyzed. Instead, we can look at the articulations (connections) between a variety of elements in order to better describe the cultural place of technology. Furthermore, we can think of the ways in which these articulations assemble in particular ways to contribute to broader systems of control and maintenance of social order.

My project looks specifically at the articulations between gender and cellular phone technology, a mutually productive relationship that is a key site of control and power. Drawing upon both international and North American research on gender and mobile phones, I have explored some ways that the gap between everyday practices and social control can be addressed. These researchers all demonstrate that gender is a site of struggle, whereby technologies both reinforce traditional gender roles and practices, and
provide opportunities to (re)imagine new and useful ways of utilizing mobile phones (Shade, 2007; Uy-Tiocco, 2007; Rakow & Navarro, 1993; Martin, 1991).

Through this critical approach, my argument about the relationship between gender and cellular phone technology being one of control has emerged. The argument presented herein is that women, as gendered subjects, use cellular phone technology to control various aspects of their lives while at the same time, submitting to arrangements whereby they are constrained by control – they are under constant surveillance, are always accessible and in constant communications (the key tactics of control society). This is made most evident in those advertisements that ‘tap into’ mothering as a means by which to hail and interpellate the readers of the magazines that I analyze.
Chapter III: The Importance of Advertising

Somehow, [advertising] must get us to see ourselves as – identify with or acquire the identity of – a potential buyer of the product: the ‘sort of person who buys and uses this kind of thing’.

- Du Gay et al. (1997: 25)

Introduction

In order to demonstrate the argument outlined in the previous chapter, I collected and analyzed advertisements for cellular phones that appeared in two Canadian women’s magazines, Chatelaine and Canadian Living, from 1995 to 1999. In keeping with my focus on both everyday social practices and broader social levels of analysis, I have divided the first part of this chapter to address these levels separately. I begin with “Advertising as Cultural Artifact” where I situate advertising in relation to the articulations discussed in Chapter 2. In this sense, advertising is seen as a cultural artifact and microcosm of social discourse, and I explore why advertising is applicable for this kind of research. In other words, the first section discusses why advertisements are a good source for the analysis done in Chapter 4. In the second section, “Advertising as Process,” I consider the role of advertising in the assemblages that I begin to tentatively sketch out in my conclusions (Chapter 5). I speculate that through assemblages the relationship between gender and cellular phones becomes a mechanism of governmentality, which produces particular identities and subjects. In this section, I consider how advertising contributes to the production of identities and subjects. In the third section, “Data Sources and Collection,” I discuss the magazines from which these advertisements have been taken and briefly outline the importance of the time period that frames this project. In addition, I discuss how themes emerge as organizing principles
when I consider articulations in Chapter 4. Finally, I consider some limitations to my research.

**Advertising as Cultural Artifact**

Advertising is a cultural artifact that renders visible the articulation between gender and cellular phone technology. The aim of this section is to demonstrate that through an analysis of advertisements, the articulation between gender and cell phones can be seen. Advertising is a rich source for cultural analyses. Cultural studies researchers exploring the relationship between gender and technology have found advertisements to be particularly useful for capturing and providing evidence for their arguments. Mohun (2003) examines advertisements from the 1920s to demonstrate early anxieties about gender relations and laundry services, whereby advertisers employed scientific discourses about the processes of laundering in order to impress women customers. More recently, Shade (2007) uses marketing materials and advertisements to demonstrate the materiality of how gender is inscribed onto cellular phones. Also, to account for television’s role in securing and rationalizing neoliberalism within the domestic sphere, Hay (2003) examines advertising discourse. In short, advertising is a rich body upon which to draw for cultural studies research.

Advertisers work to capture dominant discourses in order to connect with the audience. According to Jhally,

Advertising ... does not work by creating values and attitudes out of nothing but by drawing upon and rechanneling concerns that the target audience (and the culture) already shares (1999: 229).
Therefore, advertisers work hard to identify what are regarded as common values and attitudes, insert their product, and then (re)present these discourses in their advertisements, while targeting specific demographic market segments. They draw upon already-circulating discourses in order to sell their products. However, while advertising does draw upon pre-existing discourses, it also is a discourse. Advertising has become a “privileged form of discourse” (Leiss, Kline & Jhally, 1990: 1) whereby it holds a prominent place in the lives of Canadians standing where once stood political speeches and church sermons. Harms and Kellner help to uncover this position of privilege in the North American political economy. They argue:

Advertising is significant because, in consumer capitalism, individuals depend on it for meanings -- a source of social information embedded in commodities that mediate interpersonal relations and personal identity. Advertising should therefore be conceived as an important institution in the consumer society because it produces "patterned systems of meaning" which play a key role in individual socialization and social reproduction (Harms and Kellner, undated).

Cellular phone advertising can be considered as a significant part of the process by which cellular phones become embedded within the everyday cultural practices of Canadian women. Advertising produces a discourse about gender and cellular phones, and women mediate their gendered identities in and through these discourses.

The critical approach for understanding technological culture asks the researcher to consider articulations of many different elements in order to develop a more in-depth understanding of technology. In advertising, these articulations become visible because advertising plays this privileged role in the production of cultural meaning, producing a "source of social information" (Harms and Kellner, undated) that can be interrogated. Put another way, if the researcher is looking to see how gender and cellular phones
mutually produce each other, and cellular phone advertising is a privileged form of discourse that plays a vital role in the production of social meaning, then advertising is an excellent cultural artifact that renders visible articulations between gender and cellular phone technology.

**Advertising as Process**

In this second section, I consider advertising in a different way, tying advertising into a broader discussion of the assemblages of cellular phones and gender within societies of control. I speculate that the relationship between gender and technology is one of the mechanisms of governmentality that produces and shapes identities and cultivates new subjects. This section considers how advertising is an important part of the process of assemblage, playing a role in the production of identities and subject positions.

Du Gay *et al.* argue that, “in so far as the advertisement ‘works’, it does so because somehow it gets us to identify ourselves with the types of people or situations depicted in the advertisements. It constructs us as typical ‘subjects-for-the-product’” (1997: 25). Identity is thus a key cultural component of advertising. While the subject position operates to pull the reader into the advertisement, it is an identity that is being sold. Pajnik and Lesjak-Tusek, who observe discourses of advertising in Mobitel advertisements in Slovenia, argue that advertising presents the possibility for unfixed and fluid identities. They argue:

Modern identities, promoted in part by advertising discourse, are being decentered; they are dislocated or fragmented. Creators of the advertising industry realized representing and selling products also means representing and selling identities. A contemporary subject is thus
conceptualized and interpellated as having no fixed or permanent identity (Pajnik and Lesjak-Tusek, 2002; 281).

If identities are not fixed, then they are open to being "new and improved." Therefore, advertising operates by locating the desires and fears that circulate in popular discourse, and offering solutions that resolve or attend to these wants. As Jhally (1999) argues, advertising does not create these desires, but locates them, rechannels them and (re)presents them in advertisements. Furthermore, "Williamson (1978) suggested if we buy the product, we actually buy the image and at the same time contribute to the construction of identity – through consumption" (Pajnik and Lesjak-Tusek, 2002: 281). Thus what becomes important is considering what the image is that is being sold.

Returning to the cellular phone advertisements that are the focus of this study, it becomes clear that the imagery represented in these advertisements speaks to the subject position, "working mom" but creates an imaginary identity with which the reader identifies ("Supermom"). We buy products because we are buying into a particular modality of life offered in the advertisements.

Advertising, therefore, is a process. Althusser terms this process "hailing and interpellation," whereby advertisements call out (hail) to the reader and then interpellates them as a subject (Williamson, 1978: 50). Interpellation is a negotiation or exchange between the reader and the imaginary identity that appears in the advertisement (Williamson, 1978: 50). The reader identifies with the subject position being constituted through the discourses of advertising. For example, the advertisements in this study call out to the reader as "hey you, busy mom," the reader identifies with that position and hence interpellates herself, or exchanges herself with the imaginary woman in the
advertisement, thereby aligning herself in a particular way. As a subject position, “busy woman” becomes the “hail,” how we as readers identify with the imagery in the advertisement.

However, it is more complex than this. As Williamson argues, “The ‘you’ in ads is always transmitted as plural, but we receive it as singular” (1978: 51). From a more Foucauldian perspective, this process resonates with individualization. Foucault states:

This form of power that applies itself to immediate everyday life categorizes the individual, marks him by his own individuality, attaches him to his own identity, imposes a law of truth on him that he must recognize and others have to recognize in him. It is a form of power that makes individuals subjects (2001: 331).

Considering advertising as a form of individualization recognizes that advertisements ‘speak’ to many, but we respond as individuals, separated out. It is as if the advertisement is addressing the individual directly, appealing to their identity, which in turn renders the individual a subject. Foucault sees this subject as “tied to his own identity by a conscience of self-knowledge” (2001: 331). Thus, my self-awareness as “busy woman” thereby subjugates me as an individual and transforms me into a subject.

The relationship between technology and gender can be imagined, therefore, as being mediated through an identity represented in advertisements. The advertisements present an identity, and women see the technology as the way by which they can “become” that particular identity. However, there are multiple discourses of identity circulating at any one time. These advertisements do not determine the subject positions available to women, nor do women simply attach themselves to particular identities. There are discourses about femininity, motherhood, and professionalism; just to name a few, that
are all mediating women's processes of identity formation. As Foucault has argued, while subjects may be active in choosing between, balancing and negotiating different identities, the choices available to them are bound by the socially formed discursive networks that operate within relations of power (Frow and Morris, 2000). Thus, power relations order the discursive environment in which women are negotiating their identities.

Data Sources and Collection

The Magazines

As I have indicated, I am focusing on the relationship between gender and cellular phones that focuses on a particular gendered subject position – middle-class, heterosexual mothers\(^{20}\), because this was a key market during the domestication of mobile phone technologies. This segment of the market played an important role in how and under what circumstances cellular phones became part of everyday practice. My review of the literature in Chapter 2 demonstrated that there was very little research on this particular segment, while also pointing the lack of research from a North American perspective. I have chosen to narrow down the geographical segment to look at Canadian representations, because this is my own position as a researcher, and Canadian research is underrepresented in academic literature.

I collected and analyzed advertisements for Nokia, Motorola and Cantel that appeared in two popular Canadian women's magazines, *Chatelaine* and *Canadian Living*. These are

\(^{20}\) Sometimes referred to colloquially as “soccer moms.”
two magazines that target a particular female market. Their readers are typically English speaking, between the ages of 18 and 48, with an income of $50,000 or greater, living in urban Canadian centres (Canadian Living, 2006; Chatelaine, 2006).

By the end of 1994, approximately 1.8 million Canadians owned a cellular phone (CWTA, 2007). This technology was certainly not yet part of everyday life. It was positioned on the periphery, mainly used as a tool for business. By 1995, however, advertisements for cellular phones began to appear in magazines aimed at middle-class, English-speaking women, including Chatelaine and Canadian Living21. While magazines can clearly identify their subscriber base, they cannot determine the entirety of their audience. Magazines are in libraries, doctor’s offices, government services waiting rooms and other public places in which a wide variety of people circulate. So, advertisements, though geared to a “middle-class woman” permeate other markets. While these categories are unstable, it is not the focus of this paper to consider who reads the advertisements. Market research firms work to specifically target a particular subject position (women), believing that they know a salient set of facts about these women based on research.

The Historical Period

This project looks back to the time period during which mobile phones were becoming integrated into our daily lives. I locate this moment as beginning in 1995, and ending in

21 I arrive at this conclusion based on the media kits provided by both Chatelaine and Canadian Living, both of whom clearly identify this particular audience in their market research data (Canadian Living, 2006; Chatelaine, 2006).
1999. I located this time period by analyzing cellular phone adoption and use statistics found on the Canadian Wireless Telecommunications Association website (CWTA, 2006), as well as information gathered from Statistics Canada (StatsCan, 2000). During this five-year period, a myriad of advertisements presented many different images and discourses of mobility. Before 1995, cellular phones were still considered mainly a device for business use, and as such had not become quotidian in their use. Before 1996, cellular phone service in Canada was a regional duopoly, with only two providers offering service. Since that time, a number of different choices for cellular phone users have arrived on the market (Statistics Canada, 2000). By 2000, the majority of Canadian households already had at least one cellular phone (Statistics Canada, 2000). These figures are supported by the Canadian Wireless Telecommunications Association, which charts cellular phone growth of almost 400% between 1995 and 2000.

The Advertisements

My data was derived from analyzing 120 magazines. Each issue (January through December) of Chatelaine and Canadian Living from 1995 through 1999 was analyzed (12 issues x 5 years x 2 magazines). From this set, I located thirty-seven advertisements for cellular phones. In total, four different companies were represented in a total of thirty advertisements as follows: Nokia, 20 advertisements; Motorola, 13 advertisements; Cantel, 3 advertisements; Ericcson, 1 advertisement. This number was reduced considerably, by eliminating duplicates (advertisements that ran more than once in one magazine, or appeared in both magazines) and two advertisements that did not fit within

---

22 Again, I note that these are not strict and firm dates (marketing to this particular segment, and 'seeping' of cell phone technology did not begin on January 1, 1995). Instead, these years were particularly relevant because there was a huge increase in non-corporate sales during this time period.
the scope of this research. These advertisements, one by Ericsson and one by Cantel, were removed because they did not appear to have anything to do with gender. This left a total of 13 advertisements for analysis (see Appendix XIV).

**The Development of Themes**

Slack and Wise (2005), while providing a method for theorizing technology using articulations and assemblages, do not provide the researcher with a toolkit or set of guidelines to guide the research process. So, while I knew that I wanted to use the advertisements to demonstrate the argument that I was making about the relationship between women and cellular phones in their everyday lives, I did not have a clear set of steps to follow to proceed with my analysis. As a result, I had to produce some sort of useful way of sorting through the themes that I saw emerging in the advertisements. Approaching the advertisements with the intention of seeing how the relationship between gender and cellular phones was represented, I identified five themes: *mothering, professionalism, mobility, safety/surveillance* and *isolation*. These themes developed through my initial theoretical framework and literature review that suggested some possibilities for organizing my analysis. These themes consolidated and were refined in the analytical stage. In other words, I could ‘see’ my theoretical framework appearing in the advertisements. For example, Rakow and Navarro (1993) discussed remote mothering, and how with cellular phones women existed simultaneously in two different spaces – the office and the home. Therefore, I knew there was tension between women’s roles as a mother and as an employee. This led to the development of the themes of

---

23 The Ericsson advertisement was simply a picture of a cellular phone, vertically placed in the centre of the advertisement. At the point when I found myself attempting to inscribe phallic representations onto this image, I felt that maybe I should just leave it alone.
mothering and professionalism, as discrete categories\(^{24}\) or themes that I could organize my argument around. It is important to recognize that while these themes became clear to me as I organized my notes about the advertisements, they are not the only themes that could have arisen. There are a plethora of other useful themes that I could have considered – these ones seemed to fit cogently within my theoretical analytics. That said, this analysis is not meant as an exhaustive account of the ways in which gender and cellular phone technology emerges.

**Limitations of this Research**

The focus of this project is not on how women, as gendered subjects, actually use cellular phones. This research cannot translate into a document that describes the utility and/or frustration that women feel about being constantly connected, although I do believe that because advertisements capture dominant discourses (as discussed previously), they can certainly be suggestive of the tension that is at play in the relationship between gender and cell phones. That said, however, advertising is somewhat problematic as a source. While I have argued that advertising is a useful site for the interrogation and uncovering of dominant discourse, it is a highly mediated, constructed source. Advertisements are created after completing market research surveys, demographic statistics and other complex cultural interrogations, and then building advertisements that reflect and reinforce the demographics that they speak to. As such, advertising is manipulative and persuasive.

\(^{24}\) Not discrete in reality, but only for the purposes of analysis.
Furthermore, I have only looked at a very small sample, and a very specific intersection of “women” – a term that is in and of itself problematic. As a result of the limited sampling, I have only considered the relationship between gender and cellular phones as it is represented for white, middle-class, Canadian women (at least in the advertisements, perhaps not in the readership). While this cultural intersection has played a vital role in the “seeping in” of cellular phones into everyday life, they are not the only people who are using cellular phones for reasons other than business. Some research that looks at the teen market, for example, demonstrates the very important role that teens play in the consumer cycle of cellular phone use.

Finally, while considering the intersection between gender and cellular phones, I have only looked at one particular gendered subject position: women. I believe that the constitution of masculinity, for example, in relation to cellular phones would be equally as complex and interesting. Researchers need to think about the narrow boundaries of masculinity, when defined as the ‘businessman’ who should carry a cellular phone, and how these kinds of representations and discourses both enable and constrain particularly male gendered experiences.

**Summary**

This chapter has focused on why I have used advertising to demonstrate the argument that I am making about the relationship of control between women and cellular phones. I have organized this section to be in keeping with the rest of my thesis, separating my discussion of advertising into two sections. In the first section, I wanted to use advertisements as a cultural artifact, or social discourse that captures current cultural
anxieties and discourses and reflects them. In Chapter 4, I discuss the five themes that I have introduced to organize my exploration of the ways in which control works out at the level of everyday uses and practices relating to cellular phones, particularly as they intersect with gender. This section has demonstrated that using the representations of the relationship between women and cellular phones as they appear in advertising is a good source for this kind of analysis.

In my concluding chapter (Chapter 5), I speculate about how this articulation between gender and cellular phones should be placed within the broader social context of assemblages. Perhaps an exploration of the assemblages, or broader social context of this articulation is a good way to explore governmentality, or more specifically control societies. As a mechanism of governmentality, the mutually productive relationship between women and cell phones produces new identities and subjects. Advertising, through hailing and interpellating is an important part of this assemblage process. DuGay et al. (1997) stated it simply; advertisers need people to identify with the people in the advertisements in order to sell products. They count on readers who will be interpellated into the advertisements – who see themselves (or how they might imagine themselves to be), if they were to buy the product.
Chapter IV: Control and Everyday Practices: Exploring Articulations of Gender and Cell Phones

You know what the microwave oven did for your kitchen? That's what a Motorola cellular phone will do for your car. It's simple, it's dependable and it keeps you in touch. -Motorola advertisement (1998)

Introduction

Emerging from my theoretical framework is the argument that the mutually productive relationship between women, as gendered subjects, and cellular phones is one of control. Women use cellular phones to help them manage the day-to-day tasks that they must attend to. Cell phones help them to control the ever-increasing demands of modern life. At the same time, women are controlled through using these devices; cell phone use requires women to be always available, under surveillance and connected. This chapter focuses on the articulation between women and cellular phones at the level of everyday practice. Its aim is to tease out this mutually productive relationship as it is revealed in advertisements for cellular phones. This chapter does not speculate about this relationship at the level of the social organization, where cell phones become mechanisms of governmentality. These speculations about assemblages of cellular phones and gender appear in the next (concluding) chapter.

Central to the argument about the relationship between gender and technology is the theme of control. The analysis of the advertisements that emerges in this chapter is concerned with how women use cellular phones to gain control over their everyday tasks while at the same time being controlled by being so available and connected through their
cellular phones. While Slack and Wise (2005) suggest articulation as a way to explore this relationship, they do not point to where these articulations become evidenced. I have chosen to use advertisements as a cultural artifact where these articulations are rendered visible. In order to provide organizational structure to the ways in which I marshal support for my argument, I have chosen to focus on five themes: mothering, professionalism, mobility, safety/surveillance and isolation. These are labels that I have constructed, and are in no way an exhaustive account of the ways in which gender and cellular phones intersect. These themes are informed by my explorations of current academic literature on cellular phone technology, and I link the themes to this research whenever possible in this chapter. The five themes herein all speak to control - control over one’s life, career, space, movement, family and so forth, in particularly gendered ways. The women using cellular phones can become measurers, organizers and managers of a variety of tasks and responsibilities. At the same time, these themes highlight that in order to gain this control, women must participate in the apparatuses of control. Apparatuses of control include being always connected to the network, continuously communicating, and under constant surveillance. In what follows, I explore this complex articulation between gender and cellular phones, paying attention to this notion of control. Each of these themes begins with an introduction to how I understand its operation in relation to gender, in order to situate why the theme matters for women. I then develop an analysis of how the gendered practices of everyday life, are about control in both senses of the term.
There are some overall trends in the advertisements that are worth noting, in order to provide an overview of the kinds of advertisements that I examined. Most notably, it was a very narrow representation of “women” in the advertisements. These women are white, middle-class, able, primarily mothers, and heterosexual. This becomes evident through various markers that the women are given in the advertisements. For the most part, the women pictured are well dressed and stylish, pointing to a particular class of women, the middle-class. Some work, others focus on parenting. Women are often positioned with children, and while there is never a husband visible, he is often referred to in the text, making it clear that the women are heterosexual and married. There is no ethnic diversity pictured whatsoever. Every image of a woman is that of a white woman. Also, when women were visible in the advertisements, they were either alone or with children. Men were notably absent. Two advertisements pictured men – Nokia used the image of Elvis Stojko, a famous figure skater, as well as that of what seemed to be a Buddhist monk. In both instances where men were visible, they were what I would consider public figures – figures of success, knowledge and power. This is interesting when you compare it to the images of women, where there was not one image of a well-known female. They were all anonymous women, who could be the next-door neighbour or a co-worker. The domestic sphere played a prominent role, with several images of houses, front doors and household appliances. When the images were about being out of doors, in settings other than the home, they often had with them elements of fear – car accidents and breakdowns for example. It quickly became clear not only what the target market segment was (white, middle-class women), but also the very narrow conceptualization of the device as fashion item, security device and communicator.
Mothering & Cellular Phones

The first theme that I have identified is *mothering*, and I begin with this theme because ‘mother’ (as one part of gender identity) is the specific focus of this project. I begin by introducing the theme of mothering as it is related to cellular phones as well as gender. From there, I discuss different ways that mothering emerges within the advertisements. I then provide a discussion of how this relates to control at the level of individual practice. This theme was introduced as relating to cellular phones by Rakow and Navarro (1993), who suggest that cellular phones in the early 1990s were useful for women who were attempting to practice mothering remotely, meaning that cellular phones helped women who were outside the home perform the tasks associated with mothering. Mothering is most closely tied to the nurturing and care of others, which is contingent upon, and constituted by specific socio-cultural and economic conditions (Glenn, 1994). Mothering intersects with other cultural markers such as class, ethnicity and sexual orientation, and these intersections have been explored in various disciplines and forms within the academic community. Glenn argues that, “Mothering and gender are closely intertwined: each is a constitutive element of the other” (1994:3). The culturally constructed division of gender is deeply rooted in reproductive responsibility and the ensuing care (Connell, as quoted in Glenn, 1994: 3). For many women mothering is closely coupled with their understanding of their gender identity. Moreover, Hayden (2002) argues that the discourse of mothering is historically and culturally tied to the domestic space.

---

25 And, by the proliferation of the representations of mothering in the advertisements, it would seem that advertisers find this the best way to access their market.
Yet, while mothering is a domestically situated activity, mothering duties are also connected with other places and spaces. For example, Medved and Kirby (2005) consider how discourses of mothering have shifted based upon the influence of corporate discourse, to the point where subject positions are constructed for stay-at-home mothers which reflect these corporate discourses. What can be taken from this research on mothering is that it is closely tied to gender. That is, mothering is considered a “woman’s” activity, one that is rooted in gendered assumptions about domestic and nurturing roles; as well, mothering is located within, and affected by space, to the point where the spaces that women occupy define the various subject positions of mothering that are available to them.

What this research suggests is that mothering is a commanding job. Mothers are caregivers, reproducers, nurturers and household managers. To be a mother, therefore, is to be in control of a whole host of responsibilities and demands from a wide variety of people, including children, husbands, volunteer organizations, extended family and work. Mothers do the work of managing, organizing and coordinating the households. In the advertisements, cellular phones can help mothers with these tasks. Mothering was the primary identity – the lead role, so to speak. Mothering work was done at home, and also in the car. Mothering was both a way by which women controlled their lives (and cellular phones help them with that), as well as a form of regulation, whereby women regulate their behaviour as a “mother” to behave in a certain way, perform certain tasks, and be responsible for a host of people and tasks.

---

26 Medved and Kirby (2005) determine these subject positions to be professionals, managers, productive citizens, and irreplaceable workers.
Mothering as Primary Identity

While women’s identities are complex and multiple, many of the advertisements locate mothering as the primary identity behind which all others follow. In these advertisements, the woman is a mother first. The primacy of mothering as an identity was visible in both the Nokia and Motorola advertisements, and was reinforced in both visual imagery and text.

For example, in the Motorola advertisement, which I have titled “Supermom” (Appendix I), the woman wears a superhero costume with a large letter “M” on the belt. It is at her centre, as if being “mother” is her central role. Moreover, the text supporting this advertisement lists off the various subject positions available for this woman, “Mother. Wife. Working woman. Chauffeur.” While each position is capitalized, thereby indicating its importance, “Mother” comes first. She is first and foremost a mother.

In a Nokia advertisement, “Life in the Fast Lane” (Appendix II) there is a more subtle location of the primary role of mother. In this advertisement, the text never actually talks about being a mother. Instead, this advertisement talks about the “important people in your life” and the complicated nature of everyday life. The images, however, tell a different story. In six frames, we can see a woman, in a minivan, with an obviously upset child, stuck in a traffic jam. In a more implicit manner, this advertisement visually constructs the subject position of mother, thereby establishing the primacy of this position. The advertisement visually marks motherhood as the first thing the reader notices, complete with all the markers of middle-class motherhood (kids and a minivan).
Due to the prominence of the visual imagery in the advertisement, and the small size of the text, it works to establish the primacy of motherhood by rendering the visual imagery clearest. As well, the use of the word ‘important’ makes the relationship to the child the most important one in her life.

This more subtle approach to the establishment of mothering as a primary subject position can be seen in a Nokia advertisement, “Nokia keeps Cathy in the swing of things” (Appendix III). Cathy is a busy woman, volunteering for the local hospital and playing a little golf. The images show Cathy in front of her house, and on the phone at the golf course. Nowhere here do we see her explicitly depicted as a mother. However, the text reads, “On top of all that, she’s married and the mother of two children.” This approach treats Cathy’s position as a mother as a “given” – a taken-for-granted assumption about who she is. There is no need to make it explicit, because the reader makes that assumption, which is reinforced with the placement of the text.

*Mothering At Home*

The domestic sphere plays a central role in the mothering discourses identified in the advertisements. Home is marked as central to the women, and several of the advertisements visually represent the home in the background of the advertisements. Moreover, those advertisements that did not explicitly depict the home visually are certain to demarcate the importance of home within the text. As a result, the difference between public and private space becomes highlighted. The domestic space, which is the

---

27 Home is represented in a particularly classed way as well, in that the images of the home appear to be suburban. No apartment buildings appear, for example. This suggest a particularly classed image of the home as well.
private space where activities of mothering take place, is clearly marked as separate, and different from public space.

A prime example of the importance of the home is Motorola’s “Supermom” advertisement (Appendix I). In this advertisement, a woman stands on the roof of her house wearing a bright pink superhero costume, with thigh-high black boots and a cape blowing in the wind. The main caption reads, “Or, you could opt for the more practical way to be in five places at once.” While the text invites the reader to imagine some kind of mobility, the image depicts a woman firmly rooted in her domestic space. The visual representation of the house as the ‘base’ upon which she stands, indicates the fixity and stability of the home.

In Nokia’s “Cathy” advertisement (Appendix III), the space of the home figures prominently as well. In the photograph, Cathy is standing outside of what the reader assumes to be her front door, holding some paperwork. Cathy is not seen in any kind of office, although she is dressed in professional clothes. Instead, the reader assumes that the home is Cathy’s base. The text reminds the reader that Cathy also enjoys time at the cottage. Moreover, this is a representation of a particular class of woman. She has time and ability to do volunteer work, play golf at the country club and have a cottage. The expectation that emerges is that women have these options available and these particular spaces through which they must keep in constant contact.
The home is evoked as a place of mothering in other ways as well. One Nokia advertisement (Appendix IV) shows a cellular phone in the washing machine – an appliance closely associated with the domestic space, and the duties associated with care and nurturing work done as part of mothering. In one Motorola advertisement (Appendix V) the text reads, “If it wasn’t for the mortgage, I wouldn’t even know I had a house.” While certainly this downplays the importance of the home for this mother, it nevertheless renders the home visible, simply by drawing attention to its existence.

**Mothering By Car**

Discussions about the discourses of mothering as particularly gendered and spatial is not complete without considering the prominence of the car. In this sense, while mothering is primarily tied to the domestic sphere, the cellular phone is helping her to step beyond the spatial boundaries of the home. However, while the boundaries of the home are loosened, and women are shown to do these same activities in the car, the car represents merely an extension of the domestic sphere. The car is still a private, separate space where women and children are situated. There were never men shown in cars in these advertisements. Moreover, the privacy aspect of the car was highlighted, reinforcing that the conversations and mothering activities that take place there are private, domestic activities.

The best example of this shift is the Motorola advertisement, “I’m not a housewife, I’m a carwife” (Appendix V). In this advertisement, the image is the rearview mirror, where two children can be seen fighting. In the text, there is a long list of all the things that this mother is doing in her car. “I live in the car. I eat in the car. I think in the car.
Yesterday, I told my youngest about the facts of life. In the car. Perfect.” The car, therefore, plays an important part in mothering, providing a new place in which the nurturing and caring is done. This mobility is enabled due to her cellular phone. The small print reads, “You know what the microwave oven did for your kitchen? That’s what a Motorola cellular phone will do for your car.” This text draws upon cultural assumptions about mothering and domestic work, and transfers all of these assumptions onto the car. Moreover, the first line, “I’m not a housewife. I’m a carwife” clearly marks this woman as bound to the car as she is to the house, while simultaneously marking her as middle-class. She is not, after all, walking, on a bicycle, or taking public transit.

Mothering in the car is visible as well in the Nokia advertisement, “Life in the Fast Lane. Simplified” (Appendix II). Again, mothering is no longer confined to the house. The six frames show a traffic jam, a mother at the wheel of her minivan, and then four images of the little boy in the back seat. Referring to the “important people in your life” and then visually presenting a young child in the car, the reader makes linkages between these two ideas, and thus care and nurturing take place in the car.

**Mothering & Control: At the intersection of gender and cellular phone technology**

The theoretical framework that guides this analysis sees the relationship between gender and cellular phone technology to be mutually productive. Through the three facets explored in this section, we can see this mutually productive relationship working out through the theme of mothering. Women are seen as successful gendered subjects through the incorporation of the use of cellular phones. Through their primary identity as “mother” the women use cellular phones to manage and coordinate activities in different
spaces (the house and the car seem to be the two most prominent spaces). Cellular phone use produces women whose central role is that of mother, commanding and steering domestic activities successfully through the use of the cellular phone.

At the same time, however, this particular gendered role controls women in new and different ways. These women are controlled through continuous connections and instantaneous communication; a mother’s work is never done. Now, she does her mothering work on the phone. Thus a whole new set of expectations is operative at the level of the individual. A woman is expected to be always available to her children, her husband, her job, and her volunteer work. The ‘down-time’ that might have been otherwise available to her has been removed.

Cell Phones On The Job: Professionalism

Closely tied to mothering is the theme of professionalism. This relationship was most clearly hinted at by Rakow and Navarro (1993) who argued that through cellular phone use, women were more able to perform both sets of duties more easily. This section begins with a discussion of professionalism, as it is linked to gender, and then explores the theme particularly as it relates to mothering, because they overlap so much in the advertisements. Professionalism appears in a distinctly gendered way, with a focus on style that is geared to women, for example.\(^\text{28}\) I then discuss how control emerges in the relationship between gender and cellular phones through this theme.

\(^\text{28}\) One would expect that advertisements for cellular phones that are geared towards professional men might use a different understanding of style, perhaps including style as “gadgetry” or “metrosexuality.”
Professionalism is a somewhat ‘messy’ term used to articulate the relationship between an individual and paid employment (Cheney and Ashcraft, 2007). Professionalism can be seen as both elitist and exclusive, where individuals are organized hierarchically based on professional ranking criteria that are socially constructed (Leonard, 2003). Research has indicated that professionalism and gender are closely linked, where professionalism works to reinforce traditional stereotypes and normative understandings of the gender difference (Leonard, 2003; Holmes and Schnurr, 2006). As well, professionalism is both enabled and constrained by the spaces in which it operates. Researchers have begun to tease out some of the ways in which gender, space and professionalism intersect (cf. McDowell, 2002; Holmes and Schnurr, 2006). As this research demonstrates, being professional means different things in different spaces, but each particular space regulates behaviour of both men and women.

In the cellular phone advertisements, the theme of professionalism was invoked partly to construct the ‘busy-ness’ of women. That is, while mothering was the primary subject position identified, it tended to work simultaneously in cooperation and in tension with discourses of professionalism. This relationship between mothering and professionalism worked to reinforce the multiplicity of subject positions available for readers to identify with and create tension between these positions. The cellular phone was positioned as a ‘solution’ whereby women who are negotiating between these tenuous positions would see the cellular phone as a way to manage both sets of requirements. Professionalism is also demonstrative of a particular classed image of women using cellular phones. It is assumed, after all, that women have jobs that they must try to balance. Moreover, the
jobs that emerge in these advertisements are “professional” – women are pictured with briefcases, operating various ‘cutting edge’ gadgets. These women are not in precarious employment situations or unemployed. Middleton (2007) researches the cultural place of BlackBerries within organizations. In her research, she argues that BlackBerries work simultaneously to allow users to manage many aspects of their lives, while at the same time creating a culture whereby people are expected to be more available. Professionalism becomes somewhat refined in that Middleton sees a culture shift within organizations; now professionals must be in control of all aspects of life. While her research does not specifically take up gender, it nevertheless supports the argument that I make about the relationship between women and cellular phones.

“Dueling” Roles: Working Mothers Answer the Call

Nokia, Motorola and Cantel all invoke themes of professionalism in their advertisements. Nokia and Motorola are specific in constructing the contradiction or tension between mothering and professionalism by using visual and textual strategies. Motorola’s “I need to learn how to multiply” advertisement (Appendix VI) demonstrates the duality of subject positions and how advertisers “play” with the tensions of mothering and professionalism. In this advertisement, the image is an outline of a woman carrying a briefcase. This image is repeated or mirrored across the page. The left side of the image is light, and the right side is dark, thereby cutting her straight down the middle. This delineation marks the duality of her wife/professional roles, and demonstrates how divided she is.

29 While BlackBerries and cellular phones are not the same, Middleton does suggest that her research is not confined to only the BlackBerry. Due to the very similar “always on/always connected” nature of cellular phones, her research is a useful support for professionalism.
The text supports the tension created in the image. “Take one woman. Add job. Add boss. Add husband. Add children. Add promotion. Add overtime. Add daycare. Add pressure. Subtract time. Divide Attention. How does this equal one woman?” Here, too, themes of mothering and professionalism work together to create tension. The text quite literally ‘divides’ women’s responsibilities between work and home. In this advertisement, space plays a prominent role, in that if a woman is a professional, she is occupying multiple spaces, simultaneously. Cellular phones help women to transcend and navigate through the complex nature of having to occupy these dueling subject positions, which occur in different spaces.

Certainly, other advertisements supported this dichotomy. The Nokia advertisement about “Cathy” (Appendix III) strategically places her in business attire, thereby indicating that she is a professional, and yet she stands at the front door of her house. The text supports this imagery, by listing off her professional activities as a “volunteer buyer for the North York General Hospital Gift Shop” yet also talks about her family and the cottage – both “private” matters. Hence, Cathy is constructed simultaneously as a mother and as a professional. It is through her cellular phone that she is able to do both.

*Mother’s Little Helper*

As we have seen, professionalism and motherhood are both themes that are drawn upon heavily in these advertisements. These themes are in tension with one another, and are reflective of the subject positions made available to women readers. One interesting aspect to the discourse of professionalism is that of the cellular phone as the “helper.”
That is, women could be mothers and professionals simultaneously by using the cellular phone.

For example, in the Nokia advertisement, “Life in the Fast Lane” (Appendix II), the visual imagery is of a woman stuck in a traffic jam in her minivan with her child, but the text talks about the hectic nature of work. The text then sets up the Nokia phone as the ‘solution’ whereby work-life balance can be achieved. It states, “Your Nokia makes calls, sends e-mail and faxes from your portable computer, works like a page, and even tells you who’s calling before you answer the call.” The cellular phone is positioned as the assistant that does the work, so that the woman can achieve balance.

In another example, Nokia’s advertisement, “It Also Comes In Black” (Appendix VIII) uses a gendered notion of appealing to women through fashion (even if tongue-in-cheek) in that it markets the cellular phone more as a fashion accessory. However, the text begins by listing the features that a cellular phone can help a professional woman do. “It remembers names and phone numbers. It sends E-Mail and faxes from your laptop. It reminds you of important messages. It calls your voicemail.” These features all draw upon the perceived requirements of professionalism, including being technologically advanced, always connected and multitasking, and positions the cellular phone as the one device capable of doing it all. Much like the woman operating it, the cellular phone does many things simultaneously. This gendering of the cellular phone was supported in Shade’s (2007) research, where she argues that cellular phones are actually feminized, embodying gender in a particular way so as to reinforce traditional gender roles.
Keeping It Simple

An interesting part of professionalism in cellular phone advertisements that are geared to women is the complexity of the technology. The technology is framed to be very complex and difficult, and capable of a multitude of intricate tasks. At the same time, it is constructed to be very simple for women to use. The framing of technology as being “simple, yet complex” is done in an explicitly gendered fashion; the simplicity of the technology seems particular to the women’s needs.

For example, in one advertisement for Nokia (Appendix II), it refers to the technology as “almost child’s play” and claims that there’s “no physics degree required.” These descriptors follow a complex discussion of the multiple ways in which the cellular phone can do many difficult tasks, including connecting to other technologies. This particular technique of playing upon the perceived fear of technology and a lack of knowledge about how to operate it is geared [arguably] specifically to women.

In another advertisement, “The answer to one of life’s many mysteries” (Appendix IX), a public male figure, created to resemble a Buddhist monk, is given an authoritative voice in the advertisement. He tells the reader that, “the answer to one of life’s many mysteries can be found in the palm of your hand.” Whether this mystery is who is calling, which phone to buy, or the more complex nature of the technology itself, this advertisement draws upon the perceived need for technology to be simple for professional women. This advertisement’s use of the authoritative male figure is interesting in this context, as it is this figure that is providing the ‘solution,’ thereby reinforcing the traditional role of
woman as “consumer”. In no other advertisement is there quite such an authoritative tone, with the all-knowing religious figure imparting information to the female reader. In this selection of advertisements, women, instead of being positioned as being able to competently figure out how to use technologies, are positioned as passive ‘users’.

**The Little Black Phone**

One final area of professionalism that stands out is style. Professional women in the public sphere must not only be on the cutting edge of technology, but they must also be stylish. The cellular phone is clearly marked as a signature style for professionals, and the advertisements proclaim the need to “show it off.” This is a particularly spatial and gendered component of professionalism. Bartky (2003) argues that women in the public sphere are disciplined in public spaces through such mechanisms as gestures and ornamentation. Certainly, the cellular phone is configured to be a part of this ornamentation.

In the Nokia advertisement “It Also Comes In Black” (Appendix VIII), the cellular phone is deemed a “true freedom of expression” due to its many designer colours. This follows the listing of all of the professional features that the phone can accomplish, including e-mailing and faxing from the laptop – all definite markers of professionalism. In another Nokia advertisement, “Speechless” (Appendix X), the advertisement simply asks, “When was the last time a phone left you speechless?” It then displays a rather sleek Nokia phone. It is obviously about the design and style of the phone, not its features or capabilities. Furthermore, “Life in the Fast Lane” (Appendix II) states, “But you won’t want to hide it. Because Nokia’s award-winning designs are available in a choice of
designer colours that let you show off your own sense of style.” It becomes clear that the professional woman has a particular image to maintain, and the cellular phone is a part of the performance and affirmation of her role as a professional. She is technologically savvy, multitasking and stylish.

In this particular theme through which the articulation between gender and cell phones is explored, control is cultivated as the central mechanism through which professionalism operates. How does one overcome the tension between motherhood and professionalism? They buy a cellular phone to negotiate the messy spaces of transition and overlap. How does one overcome the complexity of office technologies (faxes, email, voicemail etc.)? They rely on the cellular phone to coordinate the functions of several other machines. How does one present a polished, professional, ‘womanly’ image? Get a cellular phone that is sleek and sexy – mobiles are stylish, cutting-edge technology.

However, while the cellular phone helps women to negotiate and manage the various challenges of professionalism (especially when professionalism articulates with mothering), it also brings women to the apparatuses of control societies. The boundaries between the discrete spaces of the home and the workplace have evaporated, and as a result nothing is ever finished. Rakow and Navarro (1993) use “remote mothering” to demonstrate the ways in which women exist in two places simultaneously, through the cellular phone. Thus one can mother from work, and work from home. Moreover, women are represented as endlessly divided by their responsibilities and the demands placed upon them relating to professionalism. Motorola’s text clearly articulates this:
“Take one woman. Add job. Add boss. Add husband. Add children. Add promotion. Add overtime. Add daycare. Add pressure. Subtract time. Divide Attention. How does this equal one woman?” Being so fragmented is an apparatus of control, whereby women are so busy tackling the demands of everyday life that it becomes impossible to focus on any one thing for too long. Dealing with constant interruption (through continuous connection) renders the women represented in these advertisements controlled through this fragmentation of time and attention.

**On The Move: Discourses of Mobility**

Mobility is a defining characteristic of cellular phones (mobiles). This theme is almost taken for granted in the literature, acting as a given amongst researchers. Mobility, however, is a gendered practice, and I use it herein to focus on movement. Shifting through different spaces and places and transcending temporal boundaries is at the very least a key selling feature, but I also consider it to be one of the ways through which women and cellular phones are mutually produced.

Space, as argued by Bartky (2003) disciplines gendered bodies in particular ways, and discourse about space and place regulates such relational elements as gender, sexuality, ethnicity and class (amongst others). Bartky recognizes the generally increased mobility of women today, yet argues that although women's behaviour is in some ways less regulated, it is more disciplined (2003: 41). Bartky argues that with increased mobility comes less regulation, in that the female body can move in different and new spaces without overt control. However, this freedom is inscribed with practices of discipline, which can be prohibitive. While one is not directly commanded to adopt cell phone use,
the complex demands of everyday life, combined with advertising and cultural pressures exert a strong proscription to engage in the use of mobile telephony.

A good example of the possibilities and constraints of transcending time and space for women, through cellular phone use is provided by Uy-Tioco (2007). Uy-Tioco (2007) analyzes the ways in which Filipino women who do transnational migrant work are able to reach across time/space boundaries in order to do mothering work and manage their households from vast distances. In this way the cellular phone, Uy-Tioco argues, works to simultaneously reinforce women’s traditional roles, while at the same time allowing for women to reinvent and creatively explore new ways of doing mothering work. In this section, I consider how mobility is represented in the advertisements, and how these representations produce women who are creatively managing and overcoming the challenges of time and space, while at the same time being tethered in and through spatial and temporal boundaries.

**Being 10 Places At Once**

The possibility of being in many places at the same time is a key notion related to mobility that appears in several of the advertisements. The theme of mobility assumes that part of being gendered as a woman is to be spatially fragmented and multiple. There are many places to be, and there is not enough time to be at them all. Mobility works to somehow offer the impossible.

In Motorola’s “I need to learn how to multiply” advertisement (Appendix VI), the text lists off a number of places that the woman needs to be, and then “subtracts” time at the
The small text reads, "You can't be in ten places at once but you could get a Motorola cellular phone." This advertisement is a classic example of the dualism of control, particularly concerned with the mobility of women who transcend the confines of time and space. At the level of everyday practice, women are represented as needing to be in several places – as if unable to meet the ever-increasing temporal and spatial demands. In the advertisements, the cellular phone provides her the means by which she can accomplish this, but it also now means that she must be in ten places at once.

Another Motorola advertisement, "Supermom" (Appendix I), states, "Or, you could opt for the more practical way to be in five places at once." Here, space becomes the focal point because the text points to the near-impossibility of occupying multiple spatial positions simultaneously. Furthermore, time is accentuated, in that through the use of the cellular phone, you can "speed" to be in these many places. Thus what emerges in the discourse of mobility is the idea that through cellular phone technology, women are able to transcend the restraints of time and space, and move through spaces quickly and easily.

**The Return of Time and Space**

Although discourses of mobility "talk about" how space and time are less important with cellular phone technology (i.e., you can be in multiple places simultaneously), space and time actually figure prominently in discourses of mobility. Castells has argued that with information and communication technologies, including cellular phones, "places do not disappear" (2007: 172). Likewise, Dodge and Kitchin argue that the differences between places become more pronounced (2002: 341). What these researchers have demonstrated is that while popular cultural imaginings seem to imagine that space and place are no
longer important, it seems that in these advertisements mobility is contingent upon the existence of these differences. There has to be a public/private divide, for instance, in order for women to transcend it. Mobility hinges upon the ability to move (quickly) between various spaces, and it is therefore contingent upon the existence of, and differences between spaces. Moreover, time becomes more pronounced in relation to these spaces. Put simply, mobility can only exist if there are places to move between, and a time frame in which to operate. Being "mobile" involves being able to be in ten places at once.

The (re)emergence of space and the importance of time can be seen in the advertisements. Motorola's "Supermom" advertisement, for example, suggests being in "five places at once" but the image is of the home. Home is given a prominent place in the space of the advertisement in order to highlight its existence as a particular space. The woman looks off to the distance, 'seeing' the other spaces that are available. But these spaces are not immediate, nor are they near. She needs her cape (or her cellular phone) to reach them in a timely manner. Thus the distance between the home and other places is more pronounced.

Motorola's "I have to learn how to multiply" advertisement also highlights time and space. The text tells us to "subtract time" and the list of the different places this woman occupies works to draw attention to the distances between spaces. The reader is invited to think about going from work to daycare and home, to consider just how far this is to
travel and how time consuming it is. The discourse of mobility thus relies on the reader thinking about these differential elements in order to glorify mobility.

These two advertisements for Motorola appear to simultaneously complement and contradict each other in terms of mobility and its link with time and space. While on the one hand the discourse of mobility is constructed to eradicate time and space in order to facilitate women's busy schedules, at the same time they rely upon, and "play up" the differences between different spaces and time frames in order to promote that mobility.

When considering mobility in relation to the mutual production of women and cellular phones at the level of everyday practice, it seems that women and cellular phones are produced in particularly gendered ways. Traditional gender roles are supported through the use of cellular phones, where we see women positioned as straddling the public/private divide, multitasking, trying to be ten places at once. At the same time, however, there is this notion that cellular phones are helping women to overcome some of the challenges of time and space, providing them with new and creative ways to manage their daily lives. Overall, mobility is a way by which women gain control over time and space, yet only insofar as they do so in traditional (gendered) ways. They cannot be in ten places at once, after all, yet with a mobile phone, they gain some control over the vastness of geography. Likewise, time is tamed; no longer are women saying that there is not enough time in the day with their cellular phone. They have gained control over time and space. Interestingly, though, and particularly in relation to the spatial, places do not disappear, but actually become more pronounced. In this way,
women are aware of the responsibilities and variances between places, and this contributes to the continuous communication, which is a key element of control. By foregrounding the divisions between public and private spaces, the continuity and persistence of communications enabled by cellular phone use becomes more pronounced. No matter where women are, in public or in private, they are constantly connected to networks of control.

Safety and Surveillance: Women in the Public Sphere

There has been plenty of attention paid to the issue of surveillance, particularly in relation to information and communication technologies. Most of these accounts of modern forms of surveillance begin with Foucault’s assertion that modern social control is mediated through various forms of surveillance. Foucault (1979) uses Bentham’s panopticon in order to demonstrate the argument that modern forms of control operate primarily through self-discipline. Surveillance, according to Foucault, is demonstrated in the prison design, where the circular architecture of the prison positions the guard at the centre, able to see all of the prisoners at any one time. The possibility of being watched and the transparency of their actions cause the prisoners to self-regulate their behaviour. They internalize the “gaze” of the prison guards to the point where they become self-disciplined. In control societies, Deleuze (1995) suggests that disciplinary societies do not disappear. One does not replace the other. Disciplinary power, through surveillance, still operates in societies of control.

Drawing upon the work of Lyon and Spender, Green (2002) is able to situate mobile communications technology as part of this modern social control. The modern form of
discipline is evident in current practices of dataveillance, where the information trails that are stored in various banks of computers perform the “gazing” formerly done by the jail guard. Moreover, the modern communications networks that “monitor” consumer behaviour contribute to the practice of dataveillance. Mobile communications technologies, Green (2002) argues, are part of this “gaze” where not only are people subjected to surveillance through the use of cellular phones (through institutional and parental monitoring, for example), but they also contribute to the practices of surveillance by asking a very common question to people on their cellular phones, “Where are you?” Green (2002) calls this mutual monitoring, and she sees this as an important shift in control societies. Away from the prying eyes of state surveillance, mutual monitoring occurs through everyday practices and interactions between people. In short, we regulate each other.

Conceptualizing the relationship between gender and cellular phones within this framework involves considering how regulation and surveillance works in particularly gendered ways. Bartky (2003) critiques Foucault’s work on surveillance, as she states that, “he is blind to those disciplines that produce a modality of embodiment that is perculiarly [sic] feminine” (2003: 27). She proceeds to frame processes of individualization and discipline as Foucault would, but in relation to women’s bodies, demonstrating how these bodies are rendered “docile” in particular spaces. Bartky discusses how through the ways in which women regulate themselves as well as other women, gender is monitored and constrained within particular spaces. Bartky’s research is useful in this discussion, because she helps to think of surveillance through the lens of
gender. If, as Green (2002) has argued, mobile phones are part of social control and a
gaze of mutual monitoring, Bartky (2003) suggests that such monitoring and control
operates in particularly gendered ways. As such, it is possible to think about the very
specifically gendered ways in which women are mutually monitored and surveyed
through cellular phone use.

There are two conflicting themes at work in this section. The cellular phone is shown to
promote safety, in that as women occupy positions of publicness in the advertisements,
there is a chance that something could “go wrong.” In order to be “safe” women should
carry a cellular phone. This is seen as a benefit to women. They can occupy public
space, and the cellular phone will ensure that they are safe while doing so. On the other
hand, there is an almost eerie sense of being watched and always within reach. With the
cellular phone, women are under constant surveillance through such simple ideas as
being “connected” or available.

You’re Never Out of Reach

Part of the theme of surveillance is the near-constant availability of the user. No longer is
there a space where you can go that you cannot be reached. While this is often couched
as a benefit to mobile communications technology, it echoes the panoptical gaze of
Bentham’s prison. Cantel’s advertisement, “If you had to put a price on safety, this is it”
is a good example of this kind of modern surveillance available through the use of
MICTs. The picture shows a woman with her broken down car. Thus, the cellular phone
makes being in a public place safe. No longer is the woman stranded and alone. She has
her cellular phone to accompany her. On the other hand, the text reads, “With a Cantel
Amigo, you’re never out of touch with the people who matter the most. And they’re never out of touch with you.” The second part of this quote seems to produce a sort of panoptic gaze, where “you” are always visible, through the technology. Although perhaps no longer confined to the domestic sphere, the visibility of women in these advertisements is such that they remain under a watchful eye. Cantel uses this same slogan in another advertisement, “Now, even when you’re snowed under, you’re still within reach” (Appendix XI). The image is of a car that has been in an accident on a snowy road. At first, the image is one of danger, and thus the cellular phone is positioned as a safety device. However, a closer examination of the headline, “you’re still within reach” and the small print, “And they’re never out of touch with you” reveals the subtle discourse of surveillance that is being drawn upon at the same time. What emerges from this discussion is that women can use cellular phones as a safety device, as a way to call for help if need be. Yet, at the same time, they are always available. The mothering work discussed earlier can still be done. The professional work can still be done as well. There is never a time when women are not being depended upon, which works to enforce the confines of dominant gender roles.

Nokia also invokes themes of safety and surveillance in their advertisements. The “It Also Comes in Black” advertisement talks about how the cellular phone will call 911 for you, as does the “Life in the Fast Lane” advertisement. Both of these advertisements show the cellular phone as almost acting on its own, by saying that it calls emergency 911 (without any interaction with the user). This articulation draws the assumption that it is quite ordinary to phone 911, by listing this activity with calling voice-mail and keeping
track of names and phone numbers. Moreover, the images place the reader as “watcher” — thereby performing the surveillance that they indicate is possible through the use of the cellular phone. “Life in the Fast Lane” has six photographs of a woman, in a minivan, in traffic. It is as if the reader is watching from another car. The reader is positioned to “view” her car, both inside and out.

Another example is Nokia’s “Cathy” advertisement. Cathy, who is always on the go, can be difficult to reach. “Keeping track” of Cathy might have been problematic, because she was in several places at once, from the hospital to the golf course and the cottage. The text of this advertisement talks about how difficult it is to “keep track” of her, and states that, “thanks to Cathy’s Nokia cellular phone they don’t have to. All they have to do is remember her phone number.” Therefore, Cathy’s use of the cellular phone enables a kind of digital surveillance, where she can be kept track of, simply by being available.

*Escaping the Gaze: Call Display*

Acknowledging that being “always available” by carrying a cellular phone can feel invasive for women, and recognizing the pressure of being “watched” through this availability, some cellular phone manufacturers began offering call-display features. In one particularly unusual advertisement, Nokia sells this service as a way for women to avoid the gaze of their husband while having an affair. The advertisement, “The difference between a boyfriend and a husband is a ring” (Appendix XII) shows a woman who is dressed differently than the other women in the advertisements, with long black

---

30 I do not mean to suggest that call display was in response to these kinds of frustrations, but rather that in the advertisements, they draw upon these “fears” and discourses of surveillance in order to position call display as a “solution.”
gloves, a dark dress and a wide hat, with heavy make-up on. She is in no way given the markers of motherhood as most other women in the advertisements have been. Nor is she marked as the professional, as her clothing and style are clearly not work attire. Instead, she is more "worldly" and "exotic" in her appearance. The text states, "With a handy little feature that assigns different ring tones to different callers, the Nokia 6190 might be exactly what you’re looking for. Just think – now you can talk (or not talk) to whomever you wish.” Coupled with the headline, “The difference between a boyfriend and a husband is a ring” the reader assumes that this woman is ‘escaping’ the gaze of her husband (and his particular ring) in order to be with her boyfriend.

The theme of safety/surveillance is perhaps the clearest example of being both enabled and constrained by control in and through everyday practice. Women with their cellular phones are able to be in public places easily and safely. Call display gives women the ability to answer (or not answer) the phone as they see fit. As Bartky (2003) reminds us, women may be less regulated in the traditional sense, but they are more disciplined. Through cellular phone use, women are under more surveillance than ever before. They are accessible, always depended on and persistently attached to communications networks. In their everyday lives, they cannot escape the gaze.

**Isolation**

Closely tied to theme of safety and surveillance are discourses of isolation. Isolation in this study is specific to public spaces, particularly women in public spaces. Foley et al. (2007) studied adolescent girls, mobile phones and public space, and they argue that one of the core concerns for adolescent girls who feel pressure from the male gaze is being
alone. For teenage girls, being alone singles them out and intensifies the discomfort of surveillance (Foley et al., 2007: 184). Although the advertisements studied herein were geared towards an older age group than the adolescent girls in Foley et al.’s study, the concern for being alone, or even stranded in public places seemed to permeate the discourses of the advertisements.

**Constructing Isolation**

Isolation is a theme that is developed by drawing upon gendered notions of women being alone in public as being “isolated.” That is, the women were constructed in terms of isolation as being vulnerable and dependent. Isolation as a theme was drawn on both visually and textually. Not once was there a photograph of a group of women together in a public space. When public images of women were shown, it was always of a woman either alone or in the company of small children. The Cantel advertisements (Appendices VII and XI) particularly focused on isolation. In “If You Had to put a Price on Safety,” the woman is shown standing by herself, beside her broken down car. In the second advertisement, “Now, even when you’re snowed under, you’re still within reach” we do not actually see the woman, but we do see the car in the ditch, and the reader assumes that the woman is stranded and/or alone.

The text of these advertisements pays attention to the anxiety of being alone. Both advertisements talk about waiting in a restaurant for your husband, who has been delayed at work. They state, “When you’re stuck in traffic on the way home for a dinner party. Or when you’re waiting in a restaurant for your husband, who was unexpectedly delayed at the office.” The woman is positioned in a public place, a restaurant, without any
accompaniment, evoking a sense of anxiety about being in public alone. Subtly here, the gaze is being used, similarly to the responses of the adolescent girls in Foley et al.’s study (2007). The girls in the study report that they use the cellular phone to avoid the gaze they felt by moving through public spaces alone. In these Cantel advertisements, the restaurant is a public space in which someone dining alone is considered “odd” and the women reading this advertisement could possibly imagine sensing that gaze by being centred out for being alone. The cellular phone provides a way by which they can negotiate the discomfort of that situation – a discomfort that arises because women have been disciplined to not feel comfortable in public spaces when they are alone. There is a sense that the proper execution of gender in public spaces for women means to not be unaccompanied.

Offering Companionship

The cellular phone is positioned as a ‘solution’ to the isolation that is constructed in the advertisements. The advertisements treat being alone in public like any other problem that women face in their everyday lives. In response to these discourses of isolation, cellular phones are positioned as a friend or companion – accompanying women on their ventures out of doors. The Cantel advertisements demonstrate this well. In “Snowed Under” (Appendix XI), there is a photograph of a car in a ditch. The caption reads, “You’ve got a friend in Cantel Amigo.” The name of the phone is “Amigo” and the caption reinforces this with its use of the word “friend.” So while women are in public spaces, they can use their cellular phone to avoid being alone. They have a “friend” in their cellular phone.
In this final section, which is closely linked to the themes of safety and surveillance from the previous section, it is possible once again to see control in this particular articulation of gender and cellular phones. Drawing upon fears of being alone in public places, stranded or broken down, women are controlled when they are in public. The images constructed in these advertisements indicate to women that they should feel uncomfortable when in a restaurant by themselves, and that they should fear being alone. At the same time, with the cellular phone, women now have the freedom (coupled with the safety and security) to move through public spaces without hesitation. The cellular phone becomes the device of liberation.

Summary: The Articulations of Gender and Cellular Phones

In this chapter, the articulations between gender and cellular phones have been explored through five intersecting and overlapping themes: mothering, professionalism, mobility, safety/surveillance and isolation. Each of these themes has been explored in relation to women’s lives at the level of the individual, and linked back to a discussion of the overarching cultivation of control, as both enabling and constraining.

Bound: Reinscribing Gender Roles in Particular Spaces

The domestic sphere figures prominently in the advertisements, and emerges as a key site where the (re)negotiations of gendered notions of women’s work and communications practices take place. In the advertisements studied herein, the car becomes an extension of this space, and transforms into mobile domicile – a private space where mothering takes place. Within the confines of the domestic spaces of the house and car, women are being reinscribed with a very traditional version of what it means to be gendered female.
in those spaces. Women are primarily mothers, doing caring and nurturing work within the home. Women are the communicators. They are the ones whose primary responsibility it is to know where everyone is at all times, to be available for communication from any place, and to organize and communicate with all members of the house. Moreover, this research agrees with Shade’s (2007) conclusions, whereby women are (re)inscribed as simply consumers who use technology, without any desire or knowledge about the mechanics of its operation. This position is certainly reinforced in the themes explored herein.

When women do move beyond the confines of the home and car, they are deluged with systems of monitoring and surveillance, coupled with particularly gendered notions about being safe in public spaces. They must have their cellular phones so that they are not left in public alone. They are always within reach. In the workplace, women are bound to the responsibilities of mothering and professionalism simultaneously, through their cellular phones. Rakow and Navarro’s (1993) argument that women are “remote mothering,” existing simultaneously in the worlds of work and home resonates in these advertisements. Hence, while they are in the public sphere, they remain bound to the domestic space. Moreover, the image of professionalism that is presented in these advertisements is of a very specific notion of “working mom.” She is styled in a particular way, and her cellular phone becomes a part of her professional style, hence the “little black phone” that does everything from sending messages to answering email. She is disciplined in public space to be a certain kind of woman: wife, mother, and employee, stylish, busy and so forth.
Marketing cellular phones to women in the mid-1990s was a complex task, because women are not simply mothers, nor workers, nor just at home. In order to sell cellular phones to the readers of these magazines, advertisers had to appeal to that sense of freedom – that ability to do many different things, occupy different places, and be different identities in particular spaces. Advertisers had to recognize that there was a desire for this freedom, a need to be Supermom. While in many ways this is confining and restrictive for women, as discussed above, cellular phones also played a role in freeing up women to be away from home, and be in different spaces.

With cellular phones, women can “learn how to multiply” – women can “be” in five places at the same time. They can be at work, and yet be available to their children. They no longer have to be home to do the mothering, yet mothering remains the primary task of the women represented with their cell phones. Women with their cellular phones are free to be in different public spaces - at the office or in a restaurant – and care for their children. Moreover, the element of safety, while it may seem constrictive, is also freeing. With a cellular phone women can dial 9-1-1 if they need help. They feel safer in public spaces because they have their phones with them, and hence are connected. This feeling of safety has the potential to translate into increased mobility in and through different spaces for women. Perhaps women, who might not have traveled alone very often, would feel safer to do so with their cellular phone.
They are also able to transcend the boundaries of traditional gender roles to a certain extent. The advertisement that referred to the woman who could choose whether or not to answer the phone by having different ringtones, for instance, was having an affair. This is not a stereotypical image of a wife/mother as it has emerged in the other advertisements. Quite simply the amount of professional women, working in what seems to be high-powered positions (power suits/demanding jobs and so forth), indicate a freedom from the confines of domestic responsibility.
Chapter V: Citizen Jane Answers The Call: Speculations and Conclusions

So instead of worrying about whether your cell phone is going to work, you can concentrate on being the hero you truly are.

-Motorola advertisement (1996)

Introduction

The analysis of the articulations between gender and cellular phones in the previous chapter provides a glimpse of some of the ways that this relationship is mutually productive in everyday life. The main argument that I present in this thesis is that the relationship between women, as gendered subjects, and cellular phones is one of control. The previous chapter examined this control by focusing on the connections between gender and cellular phones as they are represented in advertisements, and demonstrated, through such themes as mothering, professionalism, mobility, safety/surveillance and isolation, how control is both enabling and constraining.

The aim of this chapter is twofold: to introduce and sketch out some preliminary discussions about assemblages, and to provide some concluding reflections on this research project. In the first part of this chapter, I briefly reintroduce the idea of assemblages - the broad social contexts in which articulations emerge and become entwined - Slack and Wise’s (2005) second part of analyzing technological culture. I then suggest that one way to explore the assemblage of gender and cellular phone technology is through governmentality and control societies. Once having established that governmentality is the context within which I situate the assemblage of gender and cell phones, I conceptualize the relationship between gender and cellular phones as a
mechanism of governance that helps to shape new identities (particularly, "Supermom") as well as contributing to the constitution of new subjects (particularly, "Citizen Jane"). This work is meant to be speculative; it provides a sketch of how some complex ideas about the relationship between subjects, identities, technologies, governmentality and control emerge at a particular historical moment. This work is not meant to be conclusive or exhaustive, but rather it is meant to be suggestive of future work that needs to be done within cultural studies as it is imbued with Foucauldian scholarship.

In the second part of this chapter, I provide some reflections on this thesis project. These reflections include outlining some of the difficulties and theoretical problems associated with bracketing off everyday practices from their social contexts for analytical purposes, as well as reflecting upon some of the difficulties associated with using the set of analytic tools provided by Slack and Wise (2005). I end with suggestions for future research.

**Assemblages In Societies of Control**

Slack and Wise (2005) suggest that an analysis of technological culture involves not only considering the articulation of myriad elements, but also should take into account the assemblages that these articulations emerge within. Assemblages are the constellations of meaning, or the social contexts in which technological culture is situated. I suggest here that perhaps assemblages are one way to understand societies of control.

Governmentality, according to Foucault (1991) is the proper disposition of people and things, or the ways that one governs one's own actions and the actions of others. Governmentality is not simply a modality of power, but a mentality – a way of controlling large populations across vast geographies, not through brute force, nor
through the disciplinary powers of rigid institutions, but rather in a more capillary sense through everyday cultural practices. Deleuze (1995b) applies the concept of governmentality to modern socio-political, cultural and economic strategies, and suggests that we now live in "societies of control". In these societies of control, the institutional boundaries that historically have been signifiers of the state (for example, the jail or the school) are disintegrating. In control societies, according to Deleuze, nothing is ever finished. We are controlled by instant communication and constant contact. As Chapter 2 outlined, the citizen-subject is a key figure in control societies, whereby it is the citizen-subject whose actions (or "freedoms" according to Foucault) constitute the well-being and stability of the state. Control thus seeps down into the lowest levels – citizen-subjects are the conduits of control.

Citizenship and governmentality are intertwined, wherein subjects conduct themselves as good citizens, contributing to the constitution, stabilization and maintenance of the state. King suggests that in the past two decades, governmentality has relied on "the production of civilly-active, self-responsible citizens" (2003: 297). In short, the state is reliant upon the subject's will to conduct their conduct in such a way as to conform and assemble in a way that is appropriate for governing large populations across great distances (Bratich, 2003; Hay, 2003; King, 2003; Gordon, 1991). I suggest that the production of citizen-subjects is a gendered process, whereby citizen-subjects are produced in and through gendered practices, discursive networks and relations of power. From this perspective, part of engaging in responsible, self-sufficient and civic-minded activities involves the proper and appropriate performance of one's gender. Moreover, because gender and
technology are mutually productive, devices such as cellular phones enact, reinforce and reflect dominant discourses about how gender is understood at particular moments in time. Therefore, the relationship between gender and cellular phones contributes to the constitution of gendered citizen-subjects.

Let me unpack the connections that I am tentatively sketching out in more detail. I am suggesting that the relationship between women, as gendered subjects, and cellular phones is a mechanism of governmentality, and out of this relationship particular gendered citizen-subjects are produced. Control societies function not through domination and force, but rather through a reliance upon subjects who are responsible, self-regulating and who govern themselves appropriately. The state’s stability is dependant upon a social body where individuals “conduct their own conduct.” As King (2003) has argued, conducting one’s conduct is achieved primarily through notions of being a “good citizen.” People want to be responsible, productive, good citizens. Part of being a good citizen is the proper performance of one’s gender. Citizens are categorized, sorted and organized by gender. Being a good citizen-subject means being a good gendered citizen-subject. For women, this means being a good mother, employee, wife, daughter and sister (amongst other subject positions). Conducting one’s conduct, for women, means being a part of the network, participating in the fast-paced life of mothering, working, playing, and so on. It is through the production of identity that women are transitioned from micro level practices of everyday life to macro level strategies of control societies. What I mean by this is that identity links the individual to

---

31 The previous chapter was devoted entirely to exploring this relationship in some detail.
32 This suggestion, of course, is one of many ways to look at this relation.
the social. In this way, women are not simply using cellular phones to manage and control their daily lives (although this is certainly part of it), they are using cellular phones to be better subjects, to be the ‘ideal’ citizen, to be the ‘heroes that they truly are.’

I have sketched out how it is possible to link the articulation between gender and cellular phones to broader constellations of meanings (assemblages) through the notion of the citizen-subject, wherein the relationship between gender and cell phones becomes a mechanism of governmentality. I take the remainder of the first part of this chapter to explore how this might work in through the shaping of identities and the cultivation of new subjects. I use the advertisements in order to provide some substance to this conjecture.

**Producing “Supermom” – the identity of the everyday hero**

Identity is broadly understood within cultural studies as how people are legible to themselves and others. Identities are publicly circulating ways that the self is understood and is visible. The postmodern identity is not stable, nor fixed, but is shifting and contingent (Hall, 1996; Mills, 2003). What this means is that there is no whole or coherent identity that entirely defines somebody. Instead, there are multiple identities emerging in different historical, cultural and social settings, which are constituted in and through a wide variety of social practices. Hall (1996) states that identities are the points of attachment to a variety of subject positions that are constituted through discourse in particular environments of power relations.
In the analysis done herein, there were several subject positions constituted within the discourse of the advertisements, and these subject positions both reflect and enact particular gendered understandings of middle-class women. These include but are not limited to mother, wife, employee, volunteer, teacher, communicator, and organizer. In one Motorola advertisement, for example, there was an explicit textual reference to these various subject positions: “Mother. Wife. Working woman. Chauffeur.” (Appendix I). In this advertisement, the various subject positions help to produce not only a variety of gender specific roles and responsibilities that women maintain on a daily basis, but also hint at the fragmented nature of modern life. In another Motorola advertisement, the subject positions of wife, employee and mother are consistently reinforced in the text and images:


Again, fragmented and multiple subject positions emerge in this advertisement. These two advertisements are exemplary of the variety of subject positions constructed in advertising, and in almost every advertisement, subject positions were produced in one form or another.

Identity, Hall (1996) argues, is the point of convergence of these subject positions. In these advertisements, the identity that emerges is “Supermom.” Supermom embodies all of these fragmented subject positions; she controls and tames them. The advertisements present the identity of Supermom as the ‘ideal’ citizen, balancing the increasing demands of occupying multiple subject positions. She takes different forms. In one Motorola
advertisement, she emerges in a pink cape and thigh-high black boots on the roof of her suburban house (Appendix I). In a Nokia advertisement, she is Cathy, working as a volunteer at the North York General Hospital, golfing at the club, managing the cottage and being a mother (Appendix III). Thus Supermom is not a coherent or fully formed identity, but appears in different forms and has different abilities across a variety of settings. Yet there are similarities in this particular identity that suggest the emergence of Supermom as an ideal citizen. She is efficient, self-regulating, civic minded. She properly performs her gender. She is, in short, in control over the demands of these various subject positions. Of course, she can do all of this because she owns a cellular phone. She is more super, if you will. With her cellular phone, she can perform her gender more fluently. She transcends the public/private divide with a single cell phone. She is faster than a speeding bullet (using her keypad). She can do these extra things, but she is also (re)inscribed with traditional gendered expectations. She organizes the kids, she talks on the phone, she is available all the time.

It is important to keep in mind that I am channeling the discourses of the advertising when I am discussing "Supermom" as a product of control societies. After all, she does not exist. However, as I discussed in Chapter 3, advertising is more than simply a representation of dominant discourses, it is also a process of hailing and interpellating. Through the 'hail' of the subject position ("hey, working mom"), to the interpellation of the individual through the presentation of identities ("Supermom"), advertising does contribute to the constitution of identities (Harms & Kellner, undated; Leiss, Kline and Jhally, 1990).
But so what? What does the identity, "Supermom" have to do with governmentality and societies of control? Deleuze (1995) provides two answers to this: 'dividuals' and constant connection to networks. In Deleuze's postscript (1995b), he introduces the 'dividual' as a way through which control operates in its modern form. The 'dividual' is carved up and divided amongst many tasks, responsibilities, databanks and (I would posit) subject positions. It is possible to see how control works through this kind of fragmentation within the context of my research. The variety of subject positions that are visible in the advertisements suggest a rather frantic lifestyle, one in which women are divided up and (re)formed on a daily basis, depending on time and place. In this sense, because women, as gendered subjects, are so busy with the variety and sheer volume of tasks required of them as responsible, self-regulating citizens, they are controlled by this division. They have become, following Deleuze, 'dividuals.' In one Motorola advertisement, this notion was clear. "Take one woman. Add job. Add boss. Add husband. Add children. Add promotion. Add overtime. Add daycare. Add pressure. Subtract time. Divide Attention. How does this equal one woman?" Being a 'dividual' is an apparatus of control, whereby women are so busy being divided up and answering the demands of everyday life, that they are actually controlled by this division.

Moreover, Deleuze (1995b) suggests that in societies of control we are constantly connected to networks, subjected to instant communication and constant communication to networks. Supermom as an identity shaped through advertising, fits within this framework in a particularly gendered way. Constant connection to the networks for women means that no matter where they are, they must be in reach so that those who
depend on them have access. Instantaneous and continuous communication means that women have new and useful ways of managing their lives. They are able to go to work without worry, yet in so doing are bound even more to these mobile technologies to keep them in touch.

*Cultivating Mobile Citizens: The Case of Citizen Jane*

Previously, I have established that a key component of governmentality within control societies is the notion of the “ideal citizen” – that people conduct their conduct through being good citizens who are responsible, self-regulating and self-supportive (King, 2003). This notion of citizenship has been linked to cellular phones in the popular press, whereby cellular phones seem to embody the discourses of civic responsibility and duty. The examples that were discussed in the introductory chapter of this thesis, citizen-journalists who documented a London bombing, and Andrej Holm whose behaviour was considered suspect due to not having his mobile with him during a meeting, suggest that these little devices have become important in the constitution of the modern citizen-subject. Moreover, I have suggested elsewhere in this thesis that the constitution of the modern citizen is a gendered process, in that being a citizen-subject involves practicing and performing one’s gender appropriately. These points, citizen-subjects, gender and cellular phones, converge through the production of a new subject, “Citizen Jane.” While only speculative at this point, I am able to draw upon the advertisements and analysis from Chapter 4 in order to see how “Citizen Jane” is produced in three ways: a consumer, moral guide and volunteer.
King (2003) suggests that contemporary citizenship is enacted first and foremost through consumerism. In other words, a good citizen contributes to the economy and “health” of a nation state through shopping. Of course, shopping has traditionally been a gendered activity most closely associated with women, especially middle class women. Shopping seeps into the discourses in the advertisements, not only through the purchasing of cellular phones (although this is certainly the whole raison d’être of advertising), but also as a normalized practice of gendered citizen-subjects. This relationship between cellular phones and shopping has emerged in current literature. Foley et al. (2007) argue that teenage girls use cellular phones to offset the uncomfortable feelings that they sometimes experience when shopping alone. These girls report that they often make ‘fake’ phone calls on their mobiles when they are standing in lines at the mall by themselves, so that they are more comfortable with shopping. In this sense, cellular phones are positioned as “shoppers’ little helper,” helping teenage girls perform their gender appropriately (girls should not be alone in public places), as well as helping them to shop, which as King (2003) has stated produces citizen-subjects.

This ties into the discussion herein through advertising, where advertising is nothing if not focused on processes of consumption. The advertisements that appeared in Canadian Living and Chatelaine helped to encourage saturation of the particular market segment that has been the focus herein. Women identified with “Supermom” – they were hailed and they interpellated the identity. Cellular phones are useful; they do help with managing, organizing and controlling the demands of everyday life. Women who
purchased cell phones from 1995 to 1999 in Canada did precisely what was expected of them as good mothers, wives, daughters, employees, *citizens*.

A second key theme that links women, as gendered subjects and citizenship through the cellular phone is that of morality and moral responsibility. Morality is a key mechanism of governmentality, because morality is one of the ways in which people conduct their conduct. Foucault dedicates considerable effort to understanding how morality guides and constrains appropriate (sexual) behaviour throughout various historical periods (Mills, 2003: 87). Morality, according to Foucault regulates people’s behaviours in different spaces and times (Mills, 2003). In the advertisements, women are positioned as the keepers of morality. Morality is produced through heterocentric images of wives and mothers who use their cellular phones to reinforce their particular subject positions. There are no images of “alternative” sexualities, for example, in these advertisements. Furthermore in one advertisement for Motorola, the woman is charged with the responsibility of telling her daughter the “facts of life, in the car” (Appendix V). Therefore, providing moral guidance to children is positioned as a task specific to women, reinforcing women as keepers of moral codes of conduct.

Interestingly, morality is complicated by a Nokia advertisement, “The difference between a husband and a boyfriend is a ring” (Appendix XII). This advertisement is interesting, because the woman is positioned as engaging in extramarital sex, something that one assumes to be beyond the boundaries of what would be considered morally acceptable behaviour (especially when compared to the other advertisements in this set). The
woman is marked differently from other images of women that appear in the advertisements, with a black dress and long black gloves. She is "different" and thereby is othered in the advertisements. She is also without children (whereas most advertisements at least refer to children, even if they don't visually depict them). Therefore, she is stripped of her capacity to "corrupt" children. In this way, through the key markers of othering (including dress and the lack of children), morality is not really challenged or disrupted in this advertisement. As citizen-subjects, women with their cellular phones are keepers and teachers of a particular notion of morality, and one of their "jobs" is to ensure the morality of their children and themselves. Morality thus regulates and controls the women represented in the advertisements.

One final civic-minded theme that emerged in this analysis is volunteerism. King (2003) argues that volunteerism is one of the primary practices associated with citizenship, whereby subjects understand themselves as citizens through philanthropic and volunteer work. King's (2003) analysis of the Run for the Cure elaborates on the volunteer citizen as constituted through processes of governmentality. She argues that the women runners invoked discourses of volunteerism in order to positively respond to the experience of the race, while at the same time reinforcing their subject-citizenship. Volunteerism emerges in the advertisements for cellular phones as a practice that can be accomplished through access to cellular phones. For example, Cathy is able to volunteer at the North York General Hospital (when she's not golfing, one supposes) (Appendix III). Volunteerism is not simply for women, however. Elvis Stojko, in an advertisement for Nokia, provides a testimonial to his charity work, and how his Nokia cellular phone helps him to meet the
demands of volunteering (Appendix XIII). What can be taken from this section is that volunteerism is one of the key themes through which women are produced as citizen-subjects.

What seems to emerge most clearly in this discussion is the cultivation of the new mobile citizen – I call her “Citizen Jane” because the mobile citizen to whom I refer is a particular gendered, classed and sexualized individual, connected through practices and discourses to control societies. This new mobile citizen is always connected to the network; she is always in touch. Deleuze (1995b) suggests that citizens in control societies are constituted through this consistent (persistent) connection, no longer through disciplinary institutions or brute force. As such, Citizen Jane is cultivated through her availability and her connections. We are reminded of this in advertisements such as the one for Cantel, where the car has skidded off an icy road, but the text reminds us, “you are always in reach.”

Deleuze (1995b) also suggests that individuals are becoming ‘dividuals’ by being constantly and consistently divided amongst an endless array of tasks and responsibilities. Citizen Jane, armed with her cellular phone, is so divided. She is ten places at once, but is nowhere. She does work at home and is in touch with home when at work. She parents in the car while negotiating traffic jams and fielding calls. She has a cellular phone that sends email, takes messages, calls 911, but it has to be simple to use because she does not have time to learn. Citizen Jane’s work, with her mobile, is never done.
In this section, I have speculated about the relationship between gender and cellular phones as an assemblage, whereby this relationship is contextualized within governmentality and societies of control. In a sense, this relationship or articulation between gender and cellular phones can be understood as a mechanism of control. Women, as gendered subjects, are constantly connected to networks and endlessly divided amongst a broad array of tasks and responsibilities that reflect and reinforce dominant notions of gender roles and representations. At the same time, women are able to gain control over these responsibilities and requirements. Cellular phones are useful; they help women perform their duties and help them to stay in touch with their children. This speculative work on assemblages introduces “Supermom” as an identity that emerges at the centre of a variety of competing and changing subject positions, and is one of the primary ways in which marketers have sold so many of these little devices. Cellular phones can help women “do it all.” I have also introduced “Citizen Jane” as a new subject arising at the intersection between gender and cellular phone technologies when framed within broader work on governmentality. Citizen Jane encapsulates what I see as some burgeoning ideas about the relationship between women, as gendered subjects, technology and governmentality. I have framed my introduction to women as citizen-subjects with their cellular phones through notions of consumerism, morality and volunteerism. While I cannot stress enough that this work on assemblages is tentative, I believe that there is some useful and important work ahead in this area. I end this chapter with some conclusions about this research project and suggestions for (other) future research.
Conclusions

I began this research project by discussing the difficult task of the researcher, slicing and carving out areas for analysis under the guise of “bracketing.” I asked you to suspend your disbelief in the ability to separate the everyday social practices from the broader issues of social regulation, when they are so tightly interwoven and then I proceeded to argue that technology and culture are inseparable. It seems to me to be a slippery task, this analysis of mine, whereby I insist on one and then deny the other. It has been something that has plagued my thoughts throughout, and I remain discomfited by it. That said, I feel that it has been entirely helpful to explore the articulation between gender and cellular phones in everyday practices, and then to tentatively consider the assemblages of this relationship through governmentality and societies of control. They are in some ways the same – it is, after all, about control, and as we have seen herein, control seeps its way into everything we do. It colonizes everyday life. At the same time, they are different. I don’t consciously think that I am being a better citizen when I answer my phone. Instead, I wonder if one of my kids is sick and the school is calling, or I wonder if I’m meant to pick up something for dinner.

I have attempted, herein, to draw Slack and Wise (2005) into dialogue with Foucault (1991). Slack and Wise provided me with the means to do this, hinting at something more with their discussion of assemblages. Articulations have been the theoretical foundation and method that has been the focus of this project. However, assemblages are one way of shifting from everyday social practices to discussions about social control and regulation. I wanted to fill a gap in the literature about gender and cellular phones, by
having a political (social) discussion as well as an individual one. I wanted to talk about more than just the representations in advertisements. I wanted to also talk about the ways in which advertising is a process that brings the individual to the institution and the institution to the individual.

One of the most difficult aspects of using Slack and Wise (2005) has been their lack of guidance as far as empirical research is concerned. While they do a marvelous job of situating "technological culture" and critiquing other theoretical approaches to understanding the relationship between technology and culture, their primer is just that... a primer. As such, it has been a struggle to interpret one way to get through articulations and assemblages and have it make some sense. I hope that my project contributes to cultural studies of technology work, and that others can avoid the struggles that I have experienced.

The central argument that I am making herein is that the relationship between women, as gendered subjects, and cellular phones is one of control. Women use cellular phone technology to control various aspects of their lives. At the same time, these women submit to arrangements whereby they are constrained by control – they are under constant surveillance, are always accessible and in constant communications (the key mechanisms of control societies). In control societies we are divided in and through the demands of these different identities and roles. The rigours of everyday life, being constantly connected and always plugged into the network are a new form of control. This is not institutional, but capillary control, seeping into the social body at every level.
As a result, where readers are finding ways to be “good citizens” who are responsible, organized and in control, cellular phones emerge as a mechanism whereby they can be all of the things they need to be. The advertisements constantly and persistently remind readers of their role within a particular socio-cultural milieu, that of being good citizens (good mothers, wives, employees, drivers and so on). After all, with a cellular phone, you can be the hero you truly are.

**Suggestions for Future Research**

The research conducted herein hints at the complex relationship that women have with technology. Shade and Crow (2004) argue that there are significant absences in research that considers digital technology from a feminist perspective, and this seems to be the case with cellular phone technology specifically. Moreover, Shade (2007) suggests that regarding cellular phones in particular, there is little attention paid to design, production and development that considers the importance of gender. I agree with both of these arguments, and was surprised to discover that gender relations have not really been explored in any great depth in cellular phone literature (at least within a Canadian context). Middle-class women have played a vital role in the adoption and inclusion of cellular phone technology into daily practice, and this history has yet to be written. Moreover, while my research has focused on the relationship between women and cellular phones, it does not address how women have actually taken up cell phone technology in their daily lives. To think about the active constitution and formulation of subjectivities as a mechanism of governmentality would be an interesting discussion, particularly with the background set out herein.
I am also intrigued to explore how this research might compare to other sources and articulations. For example, how might advertisements in magazines targeting male readership or business magazines during the same time period differ? I would think that control, in its insidious nature, would be equally as problematic in the constitution of modern masculinities, for example, but this has yet to be explored in a Canadian context. Further research that considers cellular phone technology as a site where multiple and complex social relations meet would help to tease out the intricate relationship between technology and culture, one that is mutually productive.


Works Cited


Appendix I: Supermom

Mother. Wife. Working woman. Chauffeur. With all you're expected to do these days, a cape probably isn't such a bad idea. Of course, there is an easier way. Motorola cellular phones. Because every Motorola cellular phone is built to withstand the rigors of everyday life: heat, cold, humidity, even vibration. So instead of worrying about whether your cell phone is going to work, you can concentrate on being the hero you truly are.

Motorola, Comstar, and What you never thought possible are trademarks of Motorola, Inc. ©1996 Motorola, Inc.
When life is a rush, rely on your Nokia. It’s the easy way to stay in touch with all the important people in your life.

Your Nokia makes calls, sends e-mail and faxes from your portable computer, works like a pager, and even tells you who’s calling before you answer the call. It keeps track of names and numbers, and calls your voice-mail, emergency 911 and other important numbers at the touch of a single key. Its powerful MENU puts all its features at your fingertips - no physics degree required. And Nokia long-life batteries and rapid chargers make sure your Nokia keeps going as long as you do.

And Nokia packs all this technology into a slim, lightweight phone that slips easily into your pocket or purse. But you won’t want to hide it. Because Nokia’s award-winning designs are available in a choice of designer colours that let you show off your own sense of style.

So when things get complicated, make keeping in touch simple - with Nokia. Powerful technology that’s so easy to use, it’s almost child’s play.

For more information, please contact Nokia Products Ltd., 575 Westney Rd. S., Ajax, Ont. L1S 4N7
Tel (905) 427-6654 Fax (905) 427-6725 http://www.nokia-americas.com
Appendix III: Cathy

Nokia keeps Cathy in the swing of things.

When she's not helping raise funds for her favourite charities, Cathy Johnson donates her time as a volunteer buyer for the North York General Hospital Gift Shop. She's an avid curler, skier and golfer and tries to spend as much time as possible at the cottage. On top of all that, she's married and the mother of two children.

Keeping track of Cathy's schedule is no easy feat. Just ask her family and friends. But thanks to Cathy's Nokia cellular phone they don't have to. All they have to do is remember her phone number.

Staying in touch isn't the only reason why Cathy chose Nokia cellular. She also appreciates Nokia's generous use of ergonomic design - things like the over-sized display, easy to use keypad, 50 location alphanumeric memory and simple menu commands that let her access any feature. Plus, there are a variety of convenient accessories available, including handsfree car kits, in-car rapid chargers and long-life batteries.

Nokia cellular. Because, just like Cathy, we think staying in touch with your family and friends is a worthy cause too.
Appendix IV: It's Easy To Forget Where You Left It

No, our new 5100 series is not waterproof — which is precisely the reason you should be careful where you put it. You see, even though it's packed with features, like an alarm clock, video games, and hours of talk time, it's still incredibly light. So, you can carry it in your hand, your shirt, or, dare we say, your pants. 1-888-OK-NOKIA www.nokia.com

AT 4.8 OUNCES, IT'S EASY TO FORGET WHERE YOU LEFT IT.
Appendix V: I'm Not A Housewife. I'm a Carwife.

I'm not a housewife. I'm a carwife.
Pick up.
Drop off.
Stop by.
Run out.
Go down.
Turn around.
Come back.
Head out.
If it wasn't for the mortgage,
I wouldn't even know I had a house.
I live in the car.
I eat in the car.
I think in the car.
Yesterday, I told my youngest
about the facts of life.
In the car.
Perfect.
Appendix VI: I Need to Learn How to Multiply

I need to learn how to multiply.

Take one woman.

Add job.

Add boss.

Add husband.

Add children.

Add promotion.

Add overtime.

Add daycare.

Add pressure.

Subtract time.

Divide attention.

How does this equal one woman?
Appendix VII: If You Had To Put A Price On Safety

If You Had To Put A Price On Safety, This Is It.

CANTEL Amigo

From $19.95 a Month

It's great to have a CANTEL Amigo cellular phone in case of an emergency. But it's equally useful when those unexpected events crop up. Like when you're stuck in traffic on the way home for dinner with your family. Or when you're waiting to meet your husband, who has been unexpectedly delayed at work.

With a CANTEL Amigo, you're never out of touch with the people who matter the most. And they're never out of touch with you.

CANTEL Amigo starts as low as $19.95 per month, and is available at any of the fine stores listed below. To order an Amigo for 48 hour home delivery or to get more information, call 1-800-263-8867.

Affordable Peace Of Mind.

Cellular Service
Available At These Fine Stores.

EATON'S FUTURE SHOP Radio Shack

*For a specified term. Local calls, charges, long distance charges and taxes are extra.
Appendix VIII: It Also Comes In Black

IT ALSO COMES IN BLACK

It remembers names and phone numbers.

It sends E-Mail and faxes from your laptop.

It reminds you of important messages. It calls your voicemail, emergency 911 and 2 other numbers of your choice at the touch of a key.

It fits in your shirt pocket. It lets you talk for 213 hours without recharging. It shows you how to use its features. It keeps you connected with family, friends and business associates.

What is 'It'?

The award winning Nokia 232 cellular telephone from Finland. See one today at a cellular dealer near you. It's the first cellular phone that gives you true freedom of expression. Available in 7 designer colours. And black.

NOKIA
CONNECTING PEOPLE
Appendix IX: Life’s Mysteries

The phone rings, and before you can ask yourself, "Should I answer?" the number of the incoming call is flashing before you. A miracle? Hardly. It's known as Caller Line ID, one of the many informative features we've added to our new 5100-series phones. So if you've been pondering the question of which phone is best for you, wonder no more. We've got what you need. 1-888-OK-NOKIA www.nokia.com

"The answer to one of life's many mysteries can be found in the palm of your hand."
Appendix X: Speechless

When was the last time a phone left you speechless?

1-888-OK-NOKIA www.nokia.ca

Nokia
CONNECTING PEOPLE
Appendix XI: You’re Still Within Reach

Now, even when you’re snowed under, you’re still within reach

You’ve got a friend in Cantel Amigo.

It’s great to have a Cantel Amigo cellular phone in an emergency.

But it’s equally useful when those other unexpected events crop up.

For example, when you’re stuck in traffic on the way home for a dinner party. Or when you’re waiting in a restaurant for your husband, who was unexpectedly delayed at the office.

With Amigo, you’re never out of touch with the people who matter. And they’re never out of touch with you.

CANTEL Amigo
Affordable peace of mind

From $19.95 per month. No up-front charges. No long-term commitment, and after 2 years, you can own the phone.

To order, call: 1-800-638-6741

Table rates extra. Minimum 4 month commitment. Call for complete details.
Now, from the
show and
still using

I.0.
Appendix XII: The Difference Between A Boyfriend And A Husband Is A Ring

With a handy little feature that assigns different ring tones to different callers, the Nokia phone might be exactly what you're looking for. Just think - now you can talk (or not talk) to whoever you wish. We call it Caller Groups. It's just one of the many personal features you'll find in our new 6100 series phones. Whether you're single, married, or somewhere in between, we've got what you need. 1-888-OK-NOKIA www.nokia.com

"The difference between a boyfriend and a husband is a ring."
Appendix XIII: Nokia Gives Elvis the Edge.

Nokia gives Elvis the edge.

Since becoming world champion, Elvis Stojko found he needed a little help with his routine - his off ice routine that is. He's never been busier, what with skating exhibitions around the globe, personal appearances, charity work and of course training for his next competition. That's why he relies on his Nokia portable cellular phone to coordinate his schedule and stay in touch with his coach, family and friends.

Whether he's on the road, at the airport or in the arena, Nokia gives him the edge because just like Elvis we're recognized around the world as an innovator. Leading the way with the development of the first digital cellular phones, with features like one touch dialing of important numbers, voice mail access, user friendly menu and data/fax capability. We've also made a real artistic impression on the judges, as our phones have received numerous awards for ergonomic and design excellence as well.

Nokia Cellular. For Elvis, it's more than just a phone. It's the secret to keeping his off ice routine as flawless as the one he performs on his skates.

For more information about our complete line of Cellular Products, from entry level analoge to sophisticated digital phones, call us at (805)437-6654.
### Appendix XIV: Summary of Advertisements

#### SUMMARY OF RESEARCH

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MANUFACTURER</th>
<th>CAPTION</th>
<th>MAGAZINE</th>
<th>MONTH/YEAR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Nokia</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&quot;Nokia gives Elvis the edge&quot;</td>
<td>CL</td>
<td>Jul-95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&quot;Nokia keeps Cathy in the swing&quot;</td>
<td>CL</td>
<td>Sep-95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&quot;It also comes in black&quot;</td>
<td>CL</td>
<td>Oct-95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CL</td>
<td>Dec-95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Apr-96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CH</td>
<td>May-96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Jun-96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Oct-96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Nov-96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&quot;when was the last time a phone left you speechless&quot;</td>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Nov-99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&quot;the difference between a boyfriend and a husband&quot;</td>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Jul-98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Sep-98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Nov-98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Mar-99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CL</td>
<td>Aug-98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CL</td>
<td>Dec-98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CL</td>
<td>Oct-99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CL</td>
<td>Nov-99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Oct-99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Nov-99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Motorola</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&quot;I need to learn how to multiply&quot;</td>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Apr-96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Jun-96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&quot;Be five places at once&quot;</td>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Mar-97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Dec-96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Dec-96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CH</td>
<td>May-96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Oct-96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Nov-96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Nov-97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Dec-97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ericsson</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&quot;static free&quot;</td>
<td>CL</td>
<td>Dec-97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CL</td>
<td>May-96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CL</td>
<td>Nov-96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CL</td>
<td>Oct-97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Nov-98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CanTel Amigo</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&quot;you're still within reach&quot;</td>
<td>CL</td>
<td>Mar-95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&quot;if you had to put a price on safety&quot;</td>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Jun-95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&quot;remember when phone calls were a dime&quot;</td>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Sep-95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Dec-95</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### BREAKDOWN OF RESEARCH BY MAGAZINE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MAGAZINE</th>
<th>TOTAL MAGAZINES SEARCHED</th>
<th>TOTAL ORIGINALS (NO DUPLICATES)</th>
<th>TOTAL ORIGINALS (NO DUPLICATES)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ChateLaine</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CANADIAN LIVING</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### TOTAL NUMBER OF ADVERTISEMENTS FOUND

- **Nokia**: 20
- **Motorola**: 8
- **Ericsson**: 3
- **CanTel Amigo**: 1
- **Total Originals (No Duplicates)**: 37
- **Total Number (No Duplicates)**: 15